Strategic Planning for Creating Effective Joint Dwelling Associations in Kosovo

Student’s Name: Drita Shabani

“Submitted as a Capstone Project in partial fulfillment of a Master of Science Degree in Professional Studies at the RIT Center for Multidisciplinary Studies”

AUK&RIT
October 2010
# TABLE OF CONTENT:

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## CHAPTER I

### JOINT DWELLINGS IN KOSOVO AND GLOBAL CHALLENGES

1.1. JOINT DWELLINGS IN KOSOVO

1.2. LEGAL FRAMEWORK:

1.3. GLOBAL CHALLENGES

1.3.1 “Energy poverty” as a current world challenge and its relevance to housing

1.3.2. “Environment protection” as a current world challenge and its relevance to housing

## CHAPTER II

### PERSPECTIVES, INCENTIVES AND STRATEGIES

2.1. Government Perspective

2.2. Joint dwelling Associations’ perspective

2.3. General Incentives:

2.4 Association strategies:

## CHAPTER III

### Actual trends in EU-countries regarding joint dwelling management:

### Case studies:

Lesson learned from EU countries’ experiences:

## CHAPTER IV

### KOSOVO DATA AND INTERVIEWS

4.1. Information collected by the meetings with municipalities:

4.2. The outcomes of the meeting with municipality of Prishtina:

4.3. The outcomes of the meeting with municipality of Gjilan:

4.4. Information collected by the interviews during field visit:

4.5. The outcomes of the interviews:

4.6. Information collected from the meeting with Kosovo Cadastre Agency and Housing Public Enterprise of Prishtina Municipality

## CHAPTER V

### 2010 LIVING CONDITIONS IN JOINT DWELLINGS

5.1. Results from Interviews:

5.2. The living conditions in the joint dwellings in some EU countries

## CHAPTER VI

### ACTION PLAN FOR EFFECTIVE JOINT DWELLING ASSOCIATIONS

6.1. Installation of the database about joint dwellings as part of the housing stock

6.2. Awareness Campaign

6.3. Refurbishment activities

6.4. Management incentives
CHAPTER VII ................................................................................................................................................... 42
DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS: ................................................................................................ 42
7.1. Concluding Assessment: ......................................................................................................................... 42
7.2. Primary and secondary Recommendations: ............................................................................................. 44
7. References:..................................................................................................................................................... 47
APPENDIX 1..................................................................................................................................................... 49
APPENDIX 2..................................................................................................................................................... 51
APPENDIX 3..................................................................................................................................................... 52
APPENDIX 4..................................................................................................................................................... 53
APPENDIX 5..................................................................................................................................................... 55

LIST OF FIGURES:

Fig.3.1: The refurbished 60 dwellings with 1800m²- Stelenova 8 in Ljubljana
Fig.3.2: Apartment building Hermana Potočnika 17 after renovation
Fig.3.3: Block No10 before renovation
Fig.3.4: Refurbished building Block No10
Fig.5.1 The results of the interviews-listing of the priorities among refurbishment activities in the joint dwellings.
Fig.5.2: The results of the interviews regarding the needs for improvements-refurbishment activities in the joint dwellings.
Fig.5.3: The description of the situation in the joint dwellings 1
Fig.5.4: The description of the situation in the joint dwellings 2
Fig.5.5: The description of the situation in the joint dwellings 3
Fig.5.6: Un-going works for painting of façades in joint dwellings in Gjilan
Fig.5.7: A view from a damaged façade of a joint dwelling in Prishtina
Fig.5.8: The common spaces in a joint dwelling in Prishtina
Fig.5.9: The joint dwellings in Prishtina
Fig.5.10: The entrance of a joint dwelling in Gjilan

LIST OF TABLES:

Table 1.1: Statistical data for the joint dwellings in six municipalities
Table 2.1: Forms of housing subsidies
Table 5.1. Listing of the 8 (eight) improvements by 2010 priority
Table 5.2: Categorization of countries in Europe based on climate and socio-economic category
Table 5.3: The energy savings, the annual investments for conserved energy and of CO2 mitigation, and payback period
Table 6.1- Action Plan, the approximately cost and the estimated time
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I would like to acknowledge the contribution of the funding institutions of this Master Program—USAID and Kosovo Government for giving us civil servants of the Kosovo Government, the opportunity to study at a prestigious university such as American University in Kosovo – AUK in partnership with Rochester Institute of Technology – RIT.

It made us possible to increase the knowledge of the modern Public Administration functioning, new context and trends in the world, the meaning of an effective and efficient Public Administration which would help us in future work in the Public Administration.

 Particularly, my thanks go to the AUK & RIT professors who with their experience helped us learning the important information needed for the building of the modern and democratic society and the role of civil servants in it.

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Brian Bowen, for his support, feedback provided and giving me suggestions and recommendations throughout the Capstone Project work. Likewise, I am also grateful to my consultants: Iris Behr, German Senior legal consultant, Kadir Hysein, first political advisor in the Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning (MESP), Muhamet Malsiu, Director of the Environment Department under MESP, Maliq Pireci, Director of Kosovar Association for Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency – AKEREE, who with patience and good advices helped me a lot during the developing of Capstone Project.

My deepest thanks go to my family, for their understanding and support throughout the whole Master Program and especially while I was preparing the Capstone Project.

Finally, I want to thank the MESP for their understanding for my engagement in the Courses throughout the Master Program and particularly, my thanks go to my colleges for their strong support for finalizing of this Master Degree.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Kosovo is a young state and has to establish processes for effective state functioning. It can confront challenges by a reasonable and sustainable approach. Housing problems are just one part of the big list of challenges facing Kosovo Government.

Currently, Kosovo do not have any management system regarding joint dwellings or condominiums. The only mechanism that the Kosovo Government has created was the Law No.03/L-091 on “Use, administration and maintenance of the housing joint ownership”. The purpose of this law was to regulate the rights and obligations of the owners of apartments regarding the management of the common property in the joint dwellings.

This project addresses the problem of Joint ownership Buildings– hereafter Joint Dwellings in Kosovo, which is in a poor condition regarding management and maintenance. It is imperative to initiate the enforcement of the Law no 03/L-091.

The objective of this project was to increase the awareness of apartment owners of the importance of their involvement in the management and maintenance of the buildings. The creation of the owner associations (OA) –hereafter joint dwelling associations (JDA) is the precondition for effective establishment of the management system of the joint dwellings.

Another objective was to investigate the current framework, the obstacles, and the requirements for creating effective JDA’s. The approach should be a cooperative one between government, municipalities and apartment owners. They must work together in order to create sustainable JDA’s. It will include legal, financial, organisational and behavioural elements. An organized system of management and maintenance in joint dwellings is an essential tool to improve multi-flat housing stock. It will contribute to individual well-being, a better standard of living and achieving climate protection goals. The research methodology included data-collection by interviews, individual net-research and the use of existing surveys.

The measure proposed to contribute to the creation of effective joint dwelling associations is divided into two groups. First of all, the activities toward better services should be provided by the local and central government regarding housing. These activities include institutional capacity building, installation of the housing database and providing the needed information to the community. Secondly, the activities for better organizing of the apartment owners living in the joint dwellings should take place. These activities include the establishment of the owner associations as a precondition for gaining the grants for the refurbishment of the joint dwellings and incentives for their early start with work.

The project strongly presents the case for close cooperation between public and private actors involved in the improvement of the situation in the joint dwellings in Kosovo.
CHAPTER I

JOINT DWELLINGS IN KOSOVO AND GLOBAL CHALLENGES

1.1. JOINT DWELLINGS IN KOSOVO

In Kosovo there are more than 360,000.00 housing units. Based on the Report on Housing Situation /2006/ [24] done in the Housing and Construction Department (HCD), housing buildings constructed before 1998 are in very bad conditions regarding construction quality and regarding management and maintenance. Housing and Construction Department is under Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning (MESP). This activity was realized in collaboration with municipalities. The report shows that the most of the new housing buildings are applying higher construction standards than the older ones including the application of basic energy efficiency measures regarding thermo-insulation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Municipality</th>
<th>Joint dwellings before 1998</th>
<th>Joint dwellings after 1998</th>
<th>Applying of thermo-insulation measures [%]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. dwellings</td>
<td>No. apartments</td>
<td>No. dwellings</td>
<td>no. apartments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Prishtinë</td>
<td>16500 apartments, aprox. 500 dwellings</td>
<td>no data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mitrovica</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>5876</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Gjilan</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1465</td>
<td>no data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Gjakove</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1670</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Peje</td>
<td>1590 apartments</td>
<td>no data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Prizren</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.1: Statistical Data for joint dwellings in six Major Municipalities

Source: Municipalities’ data 2006 collected by HCD, MESP

One of the biggest problems of housing in Kosovo is the lack of information about the number of housing stock. The Housing and Construction Department asked the municipalities for an assessment of the housing situation, in 2006 by distribution of a questionnaire. A number of municipalities, having in consideration low technical and human capacities, couldn’t answer with the adequate data or they submitted incomplete data.

Table 1. shows the number of joint dwellings /apartments (housing units) divided into two groups of joint dwellings: a) dwellings built before 1998, b) dwellings built after 1998. The majority of the municipalities couldn’t submit the number of the new joint dwellings. The data base included information about the application of thermo- insulation measures in housing buildings as well, but

\[1\] Municipal development Plan of Peja 2006-2025
the municipalities answered partly or couldn’t give proper information. Based on the number of population, which in Prishtina is around 500,000 inhabitants, it became evident that a quarter of Kosovo’s population is living in Prishtina area. While the ratio between individual housing and joint dwellings in the majority of all the municipalities, it is around 93%:7%, in the capital of Prishtina it is 70%: 30%. These data show that the biggest number of joint dwellings are in Prishtina (around 45% of the total).

Post-communist states that are members of the European Union have already passed the transition phase. They were confronted with similar problems during the privatization of housing stock. The majority of the joint ownership buildings i.e. joint dwellings in Kosovo had been public housing and the management and maintenance of them was organized by public housing enterprises. After the privatization of the public rental housing stock, private ownership become significant particularly in urban areas. For these social movements there was a need of a legal basis for privatization and identification of individual ownership, common ownership and management rules. Despite the established legal framework the implementation phase took a long time and followed with difficulties. It took 10 years in Ukraine, and the East European member states needed years and still have problems, with the establishment of joint dwellings associations (JDA). This was due to shortcomings of the legal basis and the financial means as well as the lack of awareness.

The privatization phase in Kosovo is not yet finished. There is approximately 10% of the public housing stock not yet privatized. The reason is the political situation through which Kosovo passed. Considering the legal and the institutional gap after the privatization of most of the public housing stock, the management and maintenance of this housing stock is not organized.

For regulating the use, management and maintenance of the building joint ownership, the government drafted and approved the Law No.03/L-091 “Use, Administration and Maintenance of building Joint Ownership” [23]. The aim of the law is to regulate the right and obligations of the owners of housing units in respect to their individual units, to the common section and to the equipments in buildings joint-ownership -i.e. joint dwellings.

In order to have a clear understanding of the terms used in this project the following definitions are given:

- **Joint dwellings**, refers to multi-flat housing buildings exclusively for residential purposes containing both dwellings and units for commercial functions;

- **Joint dwellings Association** (Owners communion based on Law on “use…”)[23] - is a non compulsory legal entity that acts on behalf of all owners of a joint dwelling;
The works of regular administration: refers to the day to day management and maintenance activities;

Incentives - financial support given by the state government, local government or any alternative financial source in forms of grants, other forms of incentives like tax reduction, administrative fees, used as tools for initiating of the creating of the owner associations in joint dwellings in Kosovo - Joint dwellings Associations;

1.2. LEGAL FRAMEWORK:

During the execution of this project the relevant legal regulations were taken into consideration. Following are summarized the most important:

- Law on “Use, administration and maintenance of joint ownership housing building”[23]-
  With the purpose of establishing of the legal framework for use, management and maintenance of common spaces and equipments in joint dwellings as well as creating housing conditions and mechanisms according to EU standards. Based on this law, for decision taking and administration of the joint dwelling, responsible is the Owners Association/ joint dwelling association or representative of the owners and selected administering council and the administrator. The Law doesn’t force the owners organizing themselves into owner communions. The creation of the joint dwelling associations is an immediate need for the management and maintenance of the existing older joint dwellings as well and for new joint dwellings as a precondition for saving the housing stock from degradation by bad or lack of management. The initiation of the creating of the joint dwelling association is considered very difficult process in general in EU post communist countries. It is considered that in Kosovo it is more than in other countries as result of an institutional and legal gap for more than 10 years as it was mentioned above. The implementation of this law could help to get the situation under control regarding management and maintenance of the joint dwellings but it is hard to be realized without any subsidy provided by the state.

- Administrative Instruction for Energy efficiency and RES especially Technical Regulation for saving of Thermo- energy and thermo-insulation in Buildings- This Regulation regulates technical specifications and other specifications of construction products used for building construction for the purpose of thermal energy saving and thermal protection.

- Administrative Instruction No.09/2008 on Energy Audits, Ministry of Energy and Mining, Kosovo: This Administrative instruction has as a purpose “institutionalization of the energy
auditing aiming at enhancing the energy efficiency in Kosovo and constituting the categories of consumers that are obliged to be audited”[1]

Paragraph (6) “The residential and tertiary sector, the major part of which is buildings, accounts for more than 40% of final energy consumption in the Community and is expanding, a trend which is bound to increase its energy consumption and hence also its carbon dioxide emissions. “
Paragraph (9)” Council Directive 89/106/EEC of 21 December 1988 on the approximation of laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the Member States relating to construction products (6) requires construction works an their heating, cooling and ventilation installations to be designed and built in such a way that the amount of energy required in use will be low, having regard to the climatic conditions of the location and the occupants.”

- DIRECTIVE 2010/31/EU OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 19 May 2010 on the energy performance of buildings (recast) [7], Paragraph (16) says:”Major renovations of existing buildings, regardless of their size, provide an opportunity to take cost-effective measures to enhance energy performance. For reasons of cost-effectiveness, it should be possible to limit the minimum energy performance requirements to the renovated parts that are most relevant for the energy performance of the building…”; Paragraph (17) says: “Measures are needed to increase the number of buildings which not only fulfill current minimum energy performance requirements, but are also more energy efficient, thereby reducing both energy consumption and carbon dioxide emissions. For this purpose Member States should draw up national plans for increasing the number of nearly zero-energy buildings and regularly report such plans to the Commission.” and Paragraph (18) says:” Union financial instruments and other measures are being put into place or adapted with the aim of stimulating energy efficiency-related measures… Regulation (EC) No 1080/2006 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 July 2006 on the European Regional Development Fund ( 1 ), amended to allow increased investments in energy efficiency in housing;…”

- DIRECTIVE 2006/32/EC OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 5 April 2006 on energy end-use efficiency and energy services and repealing Council Directive 93/76/EEC [8], “the purpose of this Directive is to enhance the cost-effective improvement of energy end-use efficiency in the Member States”. It means providing the
mechanisms and various incentives for more effective and efficient end-use of energy services to final consumers.

1.3. **GLOBAL CHALLENGES**

1.3.1 “Energy poverty” as a current world challenge and its relevance to housing

Having in the mind the importance of promoting the energy efficiency as a *World Call*, during drafting the concept of Housing policy Strategy, Housing and Construction Department as one of the goals mentioned increasing of awareness for energy efficiency measures in housing and reduction of CO2 meanwhile. The world is facing “energy poverty” as a result of overall decrease of energy sources, increase of number of the inhabitants in the world, and increase and uncontrolled use of the energy. So every measure toward energy efficiency is significant.

It is known that buildings are a big consumer of energy.

“...In fact, buildings consume more energy than any other sector of the European economy. It is recognized that they account for around 40% of energy consumption. The building sector therefore offers the largest potential for energy savings, which in turn will reduce our negative impact on the environment…” [13]

Thomas Friedman in his book “Hot, Flat, and Crowded”[29] listed five world big problems one of which was Energy Poverty.

In his interview for *Science Talk*, the weekly pod-cast of *Scientific American of the September 9th*, 2008, [27] Mr. Friedman discussed his book and part of his interview sounded like:

“…what the basic argument in the book is, [is] that these three, you know, huge seismic events—global warming, global flattening and global crowding—are like three flames that have converged to create a really big fire, and this fire is boiling a whole set of problems, five in particular, that I think are really going to shape the 21st century and a new era of history that we're going into which I call the energy–climate era. And those five problems are climate change, petro-dictatorship—the rise of Russia, Iran, Saudi Arabia and Venezuela—energy and natural resource supply, and demand constraints, and we see that from food to fuel today, biodiversity loss,…finally something I call energy poverty, the 1.6 billion people on the planet we [who] still have no on-off switch in their life because they've no direct grid electricity…”

He brings an outlook to the world crises as climate change and rising competition for energy—both of which could cause the world destabilization if we do not act quickly and collectively. Friedman proposes "Geo-Greenism”—a very ambitious strategy that would act not only against the planet
overheating but it would help America become healthier, richer, more innovative, more productive, and more secure.

Here we see the need of the emergent action for saving our planet with reacting immediately concerning Climate change, i.e. by reducing of the CO2 emissions made possible by applying of energy efficiency measures where there are needed. As big Carbon dioxide emitter, housing should be treated in the safer way by applying the energy efficiency measures and reducing the CO2 emission. Based on the UNDP Reports [30] part of the activities toward achieving of UNMD “Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability”, in 2006, global carbon dioxide emissions continued going higher, reaching 29 billion metric tons, an increase of 2.5 per cent from the previous year. It is important to be mentioned here because of the relevance of the housing with emission of the CO2. The continued growth of global emissions confirms the need for urgent and serious undertakings as World call by contributing in combating the climate change in every sector.


Some historical events had an impact in the population movement and new developments in all fields and in housing as well. After the Second World War the rapid growth of population caused the need for dwellings and stimulated intensive construction of social housing. As the needs were big and the construction technology was far away from the nowadays technology, it resulted that energy efficiency and sustainability were far less important than the quantity of flats. The biggest development in dwellings was around 70’ies and that housing stock usually needs technical and functional renovation. In different countries of Europe the need for renovation is different. As a country duty to do something in front of the energy crisis, the old member states of the EU have started the renovation process, by considering energy saving measures and they reduced significantly the energy use in the housing stock during the last part of the twentieth century. The new member states of the EU left behind with an energy performance about twice worse, meaning that the quality of these dwellings from an energy efficiency viewpoint is very low. Based on EI-Education guidebook [9] on energy intelligent retrofitting, countries act very differently concerning energy refurbishment and treating the energy efficiency in housing buildings even that legislation regulates the construction of the new buildings.
The fact described above underlines the importance of including energy efficiency measures as one of the major activities of refurbishment of the joint dwellings and the major need for promotion activities about the importance of energy efficiency in housing.

1.3.2. “Environment protection” as a current world challenge and its relevance to housing

The households are a big user of the land and environment. They are considered one of the biggest degradation factors of the environment. It’s needed to treat the world problem of rising greenhouse gas emissions as results of households. Based on UNDP report [30], “biodegradable material” is caused by approximately 70% of household waste in Brazil. Target 1. of the Goal 7” Ensure environmental sustainability” of the Millennium UN Development Goals is:” Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources”

The current situation of the existing joint dwellings represents a big factor of degradation of the environment by their existence and by very high CO2 emission value. By the refurbishment of the existing joint dwellings they are multidisciplinary benefits like energy saving point of view and environment protection as well. By contributing in the combating the climate change it would have the impacts in environment protection as well. Based on the assessments done by the EU experts, with 28% from energy-efficient refurbishment of existing housing stock, i.e. dwellings it would imply a 1.5% reduction of Europe’s total final energy demand and annual CO2 emissions savings of 35 Mt[25].

Considering the current situation of the joint dwellings in Kosovo, the sewage system is a big element of the environment degradation and it presents a health safety problem. In majority of the joint dwellings the sewage system is damaged and needs improvements. The maintenance of the common spaces and collecting of the garbage is another element of the environment degradation. The better management of the joint dwellings would effect the environmental protection.
CHAPTER II

PERSPECTIVES, INCENTIVES AND STRATEGIES

The project foreseen activities pretend aim at multidisciplinary benefits that are easier to be looked at by two perspectives, by government and by the associations.

2.1. Government Perspective

Government is responsible for drafting and approving the policies for addressing and regulating adequately the different social problems with whose faces the society.

Institutional benefits: for MESP and municipalities from this project are: enforcement of an approved policy i.e., law which aims at establishing of the management system for joint dwellings in Kosovo and would serve as a model initiating the functioning of the proposed structures by the Law and making the links between central and local level with community. The project proposes a model of cooperation between central and local level with community by joint investment and joint interest i.e. improving of living conditions in the joint dwellings in Kosovo.

In term of addressing the problem of management and maintenance in joint dwellings, this project foresees Government to be responsible for the below described activities resulting the below listed benefits:

a) Developing and maintaining of the data base in respect to joint dwellings information. The information has to be collected by municipalities’ records, statistical institutes and web based research. The joint dwellings will be divided in three major groups: joint dwellings constructed before 1970; joint dwellings constructed between 1970-1998 and joint dwellings after 1998; required data of the joint dwellings will be collected from municipalities’ data;

Benefits: Based on the data collected a database will be developed with information about the number and age of the joint dwellings which will present the stage of the living conditions in the joint dwellings and will be used as a tool for establishing of a monitoring system in municipalities about the situation of the joint dwellings. The database has to be updated with recording of the new joint dwellings meanwhile presenting the management system of them. Database would help the government in determining the future housing policies for regulating and developing of the joint dwellings management and for the future housing projections;

b) Awareness campaign in six major municipalities (Pristina, Prizren, Mitrovica, Peja, Gjakova and Gjilan) for understanding the importance of administration and maintenance of the joint dwellings and importance of creating of owner associations with several workshops, trainings, distribution of leaflets. This will be done in several workshops, trainings, publication and distribution of the leaflets during the workshops. This activity is planned to be the joint activity
of the Government together with the municipalities. **Benefits:** as a joint activity of the Government, municipalities and civil society, this project would serve as a model for future joint activities with aim of enforcing of any approved government policy. Awareness campaigns are very useful for information of the civil society with importance of any undertaken government activity for regulating of their lives.

c) **Several meeting with municipalities,** for the coordination of the activities in respect to the organization of the awareness campaign and in respect to the implementation phase of the project. The municipalities will be asked to participate in the project as coordinators. **Benefits:** meetings with municipalities would help in better organizing of all activities and seeing from the municipalities’ perspective this project would enhance the ideas for the possibilities of establishing of a better system of the management and maintenance of the joint dwellings in their territory as a environmental protection measures and improving of the living conditions in them;

d) **Several meetings with potential donors,** for ensuring of financial support for funding of the project. These meetings are foreseen for ensuring of any international financial sources for support like IPA mechanisms, CEB loans or any other sources for funding Energy Efficiency like GTZ that actually are active in Kosovo;

**Benefits:** having of limited budget as in central government also in local government the support of the donors would help realizing the project more completely.

### 2.2 Joint dwelling Associations’ perspective

Two major responsibility areas of the joint dwelling Associations’ are:

a) Operation, Maintenance, repair and improvements of the jointly owned property; and  
b) Management;  

Looking from joint dwellings associations’ perspective, financial support by issuing of the incentives i.e. grants would cover 50% of the total financing of the refurbishment activities and incentives for starting of the work of the joint dwelling association as a management incentives i.e. grants up to 500€ for established joint dwelling association, it would help overpass the financial obstacles.  

**Benefits:** The benefits from the project are in a lot of directions: environmental benefits, social benefits, safety benefits and financial benefits.

**Environmental benefits:** better living environment, reduction of CO2 emissions by the applying of energy efficiency measures;

**Social benefits:** better management, socialization of the families living in the joint dwellings, with choosing of the management council by the joint dwelling associations- opportunity for presentation
and protection of the owners’ rights and participation in policy making, and reducing of energy bills for low income families;

**Safety benefits**: by undertaking of safety measures like fire protection installation, fire staircases and other facilities would increase the safety in the joint dwellings;

**Financial benefits**: reducing of the electricity bills, organized maintenance cost lower than not organized one, possible mortgage loans for any improvement in the joint dwellings, etc.

2.3. **General Incentives:**

In the developed world it is easier to implement any regulation or legislative act drafted by the government than in the developing and poor countries.[31]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Housing allowance</th>
<th>Object subsidies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>EU countries (15 members)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Belgium, Luxembourg, Portugal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.1: Forms of housing subsidies
*Source*: UNECE publication, *2006, Guidelines on Social housing, page 64*

Table 2.1 presents the forms of subsidies divided in subject subsidies—housing allowances and object subsidies i.e. financial supports for capital investments in construction or reconstruction, renovation or reparation of housing stock.

In Kosovo, the housing stock is in a very bad state especially regarding state of repair. As the majority of dwellings are more than 30 (thirty) years old, their repair and maintenance is of utmost importance of them. Analyzing a well functioning housing market, negative cash flow appears during construction phase and in first years after construction while the revenues prevail later. Inadequate state of repair reduces the possibility for such advantages for older housing stock. Having in mind that real incomes of the majority of households in Kosovo are scarce, the possibility for repairs by the owners living in dwellings by their forces it is very low. Financing the repair of dwellings partly by loans depends on permanent incomes. The poor income situation leads to orientation in other possibilities of financing. As adequate measure for solving of the actual situation there are considered incentives as a state support for implementation of specific legal act.

The project as a financial support measures foresees incentives as defined above—distribution of the grants. The condition for gaining the grant would be creating of the joint dwelling associations and a
"project proposal preparation" i.e. a business plan for the first year's activities together with a list of major repairs foreseen for the next 5 years. These plans have to show the seriousness and willingness of the joint dwellings’ associations for further engagement in respect to management, maintenance and repair or improvement of the joint dwellings.

The grants would be arranged in a way as described below:

1. The first four winners will gain the incentives for all activities from a) to f) foreseen under Refurbishment activities (see Chapter VI- refurbishment activities page 39) and incentives for management;

2. The second three winners will gain the incentives for activities from a) to d), foreseen under Refurbishment activities (see Chapter VI- refurbishment activities page 39) and incentives for management;

3. The third three winners will gain the incentives for activities from a) to c), foreseen under Refurbishment activities (see Chapter VI- refurbishment activities page 39); and

4. The last three winners will gain the incentives for activities a) and b) foreseen under Refurbishment activities (see Chapter VI- refurbishment activities page 39).

The announcement for the grants would be done by the municipalities and would be as a joint activity with central level i.e. MESP.

The financing should be flexible: Government, municipalities and other possible financing sources currently available in Kosovo like IPA, loans by CEB or other possible financial sources. It is desirable that the cost of refurbishment to be, partially (up to 50%), covered by owners;

2.4 Association strategies:

- Create effective joint dwelling associations;
- Improve living conditions in joint dwellings by refurbishment and regarding management;
- Awareness campaign activities for importance of administration and maintenance of joint dwellings;
- Reduction of energy for heating and reduction of CO2 emission.

Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement of the project:

The indicators of the achievement of the projects would be quantitative - The number of the created joint dwelling associations (measurement tool: number), the number of refurbished of the joint dwellings (measurement tool: number), and qualitative - the stage of organizing of joint dwelling associations (measurement tool: poor, good, very good and excellent), the level of improvements
done based on the added commodities (basic, high standards) and regarding managing and maintenance (low level, medium, high level);

**Assumptions- possible risks for the realization of the project:**

The possible assumed risks for the realization of the project can be:
Lack of financial means- it is known that Kosovo Budget is very weak and it is very difficult when a country facing with long list of problems to chose the list of priorities in term of finance;
Lack of local and central government willingness to support the project;
Lack of coordination between involved parties; and
Lack of interest of the owners for organizing themselves in joint dwelling associations-as the biggest risk.

The assumed risks could be over passed by promotion of the soundest elements and convincing the respected parties for importance and the benefits of the project like improving the living condition as an environment protection measure and energy efficiency measure.

**Lesson learned:**

- Is of the utmost need for establishing of an information system with housing information because of a big gap regarding the data for the situation of the housing stock;
- Establishing of the housing institutional structures in local level and capacity building in central level would help the implementation of the housing policies;
- The hardest work during the research process was the collection of the data for joint dwellings from the municipalities because of missing the records, missing the housing institutional structures for management of housing data or institutional discontinuity as results of the changes in municipal structures after every local election.
CHAPTER III

3.1 Actual trends in EU-countries regarding joint dwelling management:

The reforms in the housing sector in Central and Eastern Europe are characterized with mass privatization of the housing stock. The transfer of the ownership was a difficult process followed with no or bad management of this housing stock. The state transferred the responsibilities to the municipalities which were faced with lack of capacities for new reality. The privatization has been implemented as the process of the transferring of the ownership for an individual flat to private person together with shared obligation on the common spaces of the property like roof, stairways, technical and service systems, plot of land, etc. This kind of ownership in Europe is known as “condominium”. State national laws regulate the way on condominiums’ establishing, function and ownership. While in some states in transition they are still facing difficulties with legislation about regulation of the joint dwellings the major number of developed and some in developing countries in parallel with fast-moving technology are on track for making very significant shifts in the property management industry.

Some important trends in housing stock management i.e. property management companies with especially regard on the condominium they are:

1. Attempting to use every aspect of technology to increase the speed, efficiency and quality of their service, like developing of the highly functional websites and electronic services with automated system;
2. Continuous monitoring and developing of their services and try for reducing of the bills for these services.
3. More effort in marketing doing this by web-pages, newsletters, leaflets, etc;
4. Flexibility in offering services and alliances between companies in term of enlarging and monopolization of the market;
5. Innovations in their services;
6. 24 hours of the services and trying to be more closely to the consumer;
7. Permanent capacity building of the staff in term of following the world trends regarding property management and maintenance with especially focus in joint dwellings.
### 3.2 Case studies:

Having in the mind that one of the trends and one of United Nations (UN) Millennium Development Goals (MDG), it is to ensure environmental sustainability; it is required the effort of every state to establish the legal, administrative and financial framework to enforce and apply energy measures thus reducing CO2 emissions.

Therefore it is recommended to combine also in this project (like in other post-communist states) incentives for the creating of joint dwelling association with measures to improve energy efficiency. In addition there are possible a lot of financial sources for energy efficiency but all these funds are managed in competition manner [11]. The conditions for gaining the support by these sources are several and could depend on the state policies.

In some of the Southeast Europe, post-communist states, one condition for the funds among other was creating of the joint dwelling associations [14]. Spread EU states there are implementing a various projects regarding energy efficiency in housing. Energy Efficiency Programs involve more than one state with different projects [5].

**In Slovenia**, (one part of ex Yugoslavia), a lot of projects regarding energy efficiency have been implemented by state and local government initiatives. They have gained grants also from EU funds dedicated for energy efficiency.

Slovenia, like other post communists countries in transition, as other processes has experienced major changes in the field of housing. As in other countries, in Slovenia the most of the housing stock was public and social housing. Majority of the housing stock were developed after the Second World War by social housing programmes. This housing stock needs a mass renovation. [12] Since 90-ties the key actors in the housing field in Slovenia are municipalities and non-profit housing organizations.

The municipal housing Fund is responsible for housing stock management and maintenance. Until now there are done a lot of refurbishment works in ex-public housing stock, joint dwellings now. In the target of the refurbishment with special care on energy efficiency, they are social housing buildings built in the period 1945-1980. The buildings built in 70’ties are in low construction quality and they don’t have any thermal insulation with very poor energy performance.

The housing stock gained from several EU energy advisory programmes and state subsidies. Slovenia took part in major energy efficiency ongoing programmes in Europe like Program EU IEE 2005 (Intelligent Energy- Europe) REBECCE (Renewable Energy and Building Exhibitions in Enlarged Europe).[26]
Among some of activities of the Program EU IEE 2005 [26] in Ljubljana during the years 2007-2008 are:

- refurbishment of STELETOVA 8
- refurbishment of KVEDROVA 17
- designs for low energy housing in POLJE II
- designs for passive building in PIPANOVA road

Fig.3.1. presents the measures undertaken for refurbishment of the complex of the joint dwellings Steletova 8.

![Fig.3.1. The refurbished 60 dwellings with 1800m²- Stelenova 8 in Ljubljana](image)

Source: Presentation of TONKA GRGIČ, B.Sc. (Arch), December 2008, on behalf of The Public Housing Fund of the Municipality of Ljubljana about LOW ENERGY AND PASSIVE HOUSING

The housing experts in Slovenia assessed the buildings of 1946-1980’ needs which results were as below:

**Technical needs:**

**Energy refurbishment as a top priority with consideration:**

- Thermal insulation Umax ≤0,3 W/m2K
- Low -e glazing Ar , i.e. windows Umax < 1,6 W/m2K

**Improvement earthquake resistance** with consideration in repair of deterioration due to moisture.

**Financial needs:**

Subsidies for refurbishment investments with especially consideration in energy efficiency (Since 2004 subsidies are available for energy refurbishment of apartment buildings - 6 EUR/m2 and up to 20% of investment)

**Organizational needs:**

- Joint dwellings’ Associations need information programmes (incl. Energy issues)
- Renovation plan
- Contemporary designs and planning of refurbishment following new trends
One other example of the refurbishment is in Hermana Potočnika 17 (see Fig. 3.2.), Apartment building with 57 dwellings with total floor area of 5105 m² non-profit tenancy apartments, with owner Housing Fund of Ljubljana. The project was realized through the EI-education programmes. The investment has been done by the Housing Fund of Ljubljana. The Housing complex has been built in 1975 and renovated in 2004. The total investment cost covered € 220,000.00- investments for covering passive house standard envelope.

Project data adopted from
http://ei-education.aarch.dk/Hermana- best practice example No2 from Slovenia:

Fig 3.2.: Apartment building Hermana Potočnika 17 after renovation
Source: http://ei-education.aarch.dk/
Hermana-Best practice example No 2 from the Slovenia

Lessons learned based on the EI-education guidebook EN 3 [9],:

"EC demonstration project enabled the design and execution of the passive standard building envelope in social housing; more ambitious measures like monitoring system and management & control systems were unfortunately not implemented, due to financial reasons and long procedures of public procurement;

A controlled ventilation system with heat recovery is one of the first future measures to be implemented."^2

Bulgaria, also took part in EI-education program projects with promotion activities for energy efficiency measures in housing buildings as one of priority during refurbishment of old housing stock. The best practice in Bulgaria is renovation of Block No10 (see Fig. 3.3.), district Zaharnia Fabrica, Sofia, the multi-dwelling building -13 dwellings, with 1100 m² living area constructed on 1947 and renovated in 2004 (see Fig. 3.4.) the objective of the project was renovation and establishing of the adequate environment for further maintenance inhabited by the low income inhabitants.
These projects are characterized with special objective i.e. promotion and use of the energy efficiency measures in housing buildings and the common element of the renovation is leading to a lower energy consumption and improvement of the comfort of the flats. The project is initiated and realized by Bulgarian Housing Association in partnership with Housing Association De Nieuwe Unie, Rotterdam and Housing Association Woondrecht, Dordrecht [3].

On the last floor (attic) there are two common premises that were transformed in small flats. The rent of these new flats will help the reimbursement of the loan.

![Fig. 3.3. Block No10 before renovation](source: EI-education guidebook)

![Fig. 3. 4: Refurbished building Block No10](source: EI-Education Guidebook EN 3)

**Project data adopted from**

[http://ei-education.aarch.dk/](http://ei-education.aarch.dk/) EI-education guidebook EN 3:

**Renovation concept**

Constructions [U-values: W/m²K]

- New insulated roof [0.5]
- Insulation of basement ceiling [0.52]
- Replaced windows (double glazed) [1.4]
- Insulation of external brick walls 0.52
- New double glazed windows with PVC frames

**Installations:**

- Improvement of the heating system (balance, insulation of pipes)

**Energy saving and monitoring**

Energy consumption before renovation: KWh/m²: 194.7

Energy consumption after renovation: KWh/m²: 105.6

Percentage savings: 46%

**Financial information**

The costs of the renovation were 104 750 BGN (approx. 52 375 euros). The project was financed through a loan from the Netherlands banks which offered lower interest rates, for 20 years. The monthly payment of the loan is 700 BGN (approx. 350 Euros), but half of this amount planed to be covered by the rent of the two new flats, adopted in the attic.
Lessons learned based on the EI-education guidebook EN 3,[9] :

“For the realization of refurbishment of a multi-dwelling building in Bulgaria it was necessary to involve all owners and to ask from them to organize themselves in an association;

The costs of refurbishment can be, at least partially, covered by an extension of the building; Most of the buildings could be extended with an additional floor;

The financing institutions should be flexible when giving loans for such projects, most of the owners are with low or medium incomes and the banks should take this into account”3

Albania, recently allocated the funds for a similar project in term of enforcing of the” Law on managing of joint ownership in housing buildings” the project would be the pilot project for the municipality of Fier and is joint activity between municipality of Fier, Habitat Institute for Development (Co-PLAN) and Ministry of Public Affairs, Transportation and Telecommunication[4]. The project would be implemented based on the good practices of other countries for applying of energy efficiency measures during refurbishing of a pilot dwelling as joint activity between local authorities, civil society and community. The aim of the project is to increase awareness of the community for importance of the energy efficiency measures in housing buildings and the role of the good managing and maintenance of living areas as are housing buildings. It would be a measure to combat the degradation of the urban areas and as an environmental protection measure meanwhile.

Lesson learned from EU countries’ experiences:

❖ Establishing of joint dwelling associations helps in better managing and maintenance, improving of the living conditions in joint dwellings and by choosing their leading bodies i.e. management council could increase their involvement in policy making;

❖ Creating of joint dwelling associations helps getting to the mortgage loans for any activity undertaken for improving of the living conditions in joint dwellings;

❖ The managing and operational-maintenance activities, including energy efficiency would have impact in environmental protection and reduction of energy consumption with reduction of CO2 emissions;

❖ The available grants, soft loans and other flexible forms of financing are very favorable for investing of projects for renovation of the housing stock.

3 http://ei-education.aarch.dk/; EI-education guidebook EN 3, page 17
CHAPTER IV

KOSOVO DATA AND INTERVIEWS

Data-collection for the project was the most difficult part of the project. So, different tools for data collection there were used. It should be mentioned that in Kosovo no data administration system for any kind of need is installed. The gap from passing the political and social systems is visible and it harms every research process. Major data have been collected by the existing documents available in web pages of the acting institutions, like Statistical Institute of Kosovo, the strategic planning documents of the municipalities, the housing database developed by the Housing and Construction Department under Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning, in 2006 and partly updated in 2008.

4.1. Information collected by the meetings with municipalities:

There have been meetings with two municipalities: Prishtina and Gjilan. The meetings have been organized as an activity of the Housing Division with the aim to promote the approved laws that regulate housing. Part of the meeting’s agenda, it was discussions about the possible promotion mechanisms for enforcement of the Law on” Use, administration and maintenance of the building joint ownership” with which relates this project. From the municipalities it has been asked to prepare a report for the housing stock, especially joint dwellings - their number, age and their current situation regarding the living conditions in the old joint dwellings i.e. joint dwellings built before 1998.

4.2. The outcomes of the meeting with municipality of Prishtina:

Participants of the meeting from the municipality authorities: two representatives of the Legal Office of the municipality, an officer for construction from the Directorate for Urbanism and Spatial Planning;

The issues addressed as most challenging by the authorities of the Prishtina municipality were:

- Lack of the complete institutional reliable information for the housing stock and
- Lack of the organizational structure for housing within the municipal level which would serve as an institution for treating of the housing problems and orientation of the future policies for solving them.
4.3. The outcomes of the meeting with municipality of Gjilan:

Participants of the meeting from the municipality authorities: director of the Directorate for Geodesy, Cadastre, Ownership, and Housing, two representatives from the Directorate for Geodesy, Cadastre, Ownership, and Housing, a legal officer from the Directorate of Urbanism, Spatial Planning and Environment and a representative of the directorate for Health and Social Welfare;

Information about joint dwellings in Municipality of Gjilan:

- 84 joint dwellings with 1500 apartments and 145 shops with total area of 95,000 m², built between years: 1957-1991;
- 10 joint dwellings with 500 apartments built after 1998 with average tallness Ground floor+5 stories;
- The majority of the joint dwellings: needs for reparation or reconstruction of the external walls, roofs, corridors and staircases, entrances, water and sewage system, installation of the safety measures and other equipments;
- The municipality’s activities undertaken for improving of the joint dwellings: reparation of the elevator in the 12 stories joint dwelling, reparation of the roofs after the natural catastrophe (volley); painting of the facades of the joint dwellings-on-going activity.

Recommendations from the meeting:

- Need for the housing institutional structure within the organizational structure of the municipality;
- Need for the housing database in the central and local government level;
- Enhancing of the communication with the civil society by the workshops, several meetings, etc in term of increasing of the awareness of the owners of the apartments in the joint dwellings for the management system of them and the results of self-organizing of them into joint dwelling associations;
- Small grants- joint activity central and local government for initiation of creating of the joint-dwelling associations- requirement by the law.
4.4. **Information collected by the interviews during field visit:**

Another form of collecting the data was field visits in Prishtina area with realization of some interviews with owners of apartments in joint dwellings. The main point of interest was the determination of the most needed improvement activities in the joint dwellings in term of improvement of the living conditions and information about the willingness of the owners for organizing in the joint dwellings associations and establishing of the main management bodies as it is required by the Law. The interview questions were drafted in the way that the interviewed people would be asked to answer with respond Yes or No; free answers and suggestions and one question required listing of the most needed improvement activities by pointing scale from 5(as urgent activities) to 1(little or no need for improvements). The model of the interview is attached in Appendix. 2

The interviews have been done in the different places of Prishtina in term of covering of the different types of the joint dwellings. Depending from the age the needs for improvement and the situation in the joint dwellings differ.

4.5. **The outcomes of the interviews:**

The main challenges for the owners were considered:

- Self-organization in joint dwelling associations and enforcement of the law because not everybody from the owners are interested;
- Financial problems for any initiative toward improving of their living conditions;
- Renovations and reparations especially insulation system- heating, water and sewage, external walls and windows, roofs, and safety measures, some cases the elevators and maintenance of corridors.

Based on the answers of the people interviewed the priority for improvements are the repair of the roofs. It was especially enfaced in answers of the owners living in the joint dwellings with an age of up to 35 years. The second priority was improving of thermo-insulation in facades and change in window. Out of the listed activities for improving of the living conditions it was mentioned as important maintenance and managing of the area surrounding the joint dwellings and children playgrounds. For self-organizing into the joint dwelling associations, the interviewed persons considered as important but the majority of them haven’t been informed for existing of the Law
which regulates the management and maintenance of the building joint ownership. The proposed forms of incentives were some small grants or soft loans with low interest rates.

4.6. Information collected from the meeting with Kosovo Cadastre Agency and Housing Public Enterprise of Prishtina municipality

There have been held and two separate meetings with Kosovo Cadastre agency and Housing Public Enterprise of Prishtina municipality.

The outcomes from the meeting with Kosovo Cadastre Agency:

From the meeting with Kosovo Cadastre agency it was understood that it’s no registration system of the ownership of the joint dwellings, there are on-going some pilot projects in Municipality of Gjakova, Ferizaj and Prishtina but the process didn’t still end. Based on some records they possess there exist around 21,000 apartments (built before 1998), but as they stated, these data aren’t complete. We agreed that the register would help Housing institutions for the future projections and plans.

The outcomes from the meeting with Housing Public Enterprise of Prishtina municipality:

The Housing Public Enterprise managed with the joint dwellings until they have been privatized. After the privatization of the ex public housing stock the Housing Public Enterprise manages just some premises that they possess as their ownership i.e. some shops, garages and the same. The ex public housing stock need urgently for establishing of the management and maintenance system also repair and improvements in term of the insulations, sewage and water supply, and safety measures. They were interested to take part in the awareness campaigns and all initiatives undertaken by the local and central government regarding management and maintenance of the joint dwellings. They have been opened for sharing the information that they have but that information was not complete. It was delivered from them a hard copy list with some joint dwellings data with information about their location and time when they have been constructed.
CHAPTER V
2010 LIVING CONDITIONS IN JOINT DWELLINGS

5.1. Results from Interviews:

The results of this research present the situation based on the data collected from the field visit, i.e. interviews, literature review and other personal meetings. The collected information for the stage of the joint dwellings and description of the living conditions in them is an effective tool to identify the best recommendations and conclusions.

Based on the interviews done with various owners living in different joint dwellings in Prishtina there are defined the needed refurbishment-improvements activities as most important.

Table 5.1. prioritizes the improvement activities in terms of improving of the living conditions in the joint dwellings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Age of joint dwelling</th>
<th>Need for improvements</th>
<th>R1</th>
<th>R2</th>
<th>R3</th>
<th>R4</th>
<th>R5</th>
<th>R6</th>
<th>R7</th>
<th>R8</th>
<th>R9</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Repair of the roof</td>
<td>up to 35</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Improving of thermo-insulation in facades</td>
<td>35-40</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Change of the windows</td>
<td>up to 1998</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Safety measures/Fire protection</td>
<td>35-40</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Repair of the sewage and water installation</td>
<td>up to 35</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Repair of the main entrance and electrical</td>
<td>35-40</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Painting and repair of the common spaces</td>
<td>up to 35</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Repair of the elevators/installation of them where they don’t exist</td>
<td>35-40</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.1. Listing of the 8 (eight) improvements by 2010 priority

Based on the answers by the 9(nine) respondents, the priority for improvements has the activity of the repair of the roof leading with 20%. Improving of thermo-insulation in facades and change of the windows, have been considered in the same range by 16% followed by the safety measures with 13%. Repair of the sewage and water installation and repair of the main entrance and electrical equipments they have been considered at the same range with 12% (See in the Fig. 5.2.)

The results of the interviews are presented as chart in the Fig. 5.1.
Fig. 5.1 The results of the interviews-listing of the priorities among refurbishment activities in the joint dwellings

These data helps in defining the proper actions to be undertaken under refurbishment activities.

Fig. 5.2. The results of the interviews regarding the needs for improvements-refurbishment activities in the joint dwellings

5.1.1. Thermo-insulation, heating system, priorities 1,2,3

The joint dwellings in Kosovo with average age of 35 to 40 years have some differences with newer ones with an average age up to 35 years. They have wider walls than newer ones but the materials used in the older joint dwellings are weaker than in the new ones.
Based on the assessment done in a joint dwelling by AKERE [2](Asociacioni Kosovar për Energji të Ripërtëritshme dhe Eficiencë të Energjisë - Kosovar Agency for Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency) the stage of the joint dwellings regarding thermo-insulation measures are in very bad condition. **Fig. 5.3.** shows the actual situation of a model of a joint dwelling with age of about 35 years and description of the composition of the walls, materials used and other construction elements as windows. The figures **Fig.5.4 and Fig.5.5.** present the measures to be taken based on the results of the assessment done by AKERE. The considered needed activities to be done for improvements of the living conditions regarding energy use and heating are: thermo-insulation of the external walls, replacement of the windows and placement of the entrance doors as construction works and improving of the heating system by removing the old mechanic valve and mounting the new thermostatic valve at the entrance of the radiators and thermal insulation of the un-insulated outdoor pipes and the pipes at the underground. These proposed improvements would cost 43,380,00 €, by effecting the energy savings of amount of 249.5MW i.e.43.13% and reduction of CO₂ by 69,347 t/year the time back period for these investments is 4.5 years. These assessments show the importance of the improvements to be done in the old and amortized joint dwellings. Some municipalities started with painting of the old joint dwellings but the activities done didn’t include the use of the neither basic thermo-insulation measures (see the **Fig.5.6**).
Strategic Planning for Creating Effective Joint Dwelling Associations in Kosovo
Senior Capstone Project

Fig. 5.3: The description of the situation in the dwellings 1
Source: AKEREE assessment document-presentation translated by the author

Based on assessments and the recommended investments the reduction of CO₂ emissions in the area are estimated 69.347 t/year.

Fig. 5.4: The description of the situation in the dwellings 2
Source: AKEREE assessment document-presentation translated by the author

The pay back period of investments

- In existing situation in dwellings for one hour the consumption of energy is:
- The consumed energy during the heating season:
- Consumption of heating for one season:
- Recommended investments:
- The saved energy after the investments for one season:
- The saved monetary amount for one season:

Pay back period of investments

Based on assessments and the recommended investments the reduction of CO₂ emissions in the area are estimated 69.347 t/year.

Fig. 5.5: The description of the situation in the dwellings 3
5.1.2. Water and sewage system, priority 5

Based on the visits to the municipalities and based on the result from the interviews it was found that in majority of the joint dwellings with average age 35-40 years the situation is very bad. A big number need the improvement of especially sewage system. Some of the owners facing with big difficulties for their normal life they improved the water and sewage system within their individual units and some rare cases there are done the improvements of the general installation system.

The problems are financially based. Economic situation harm the majority of the inhabitants living in the joint dwellings for even basic improvement needs. Facing with financial difficulties for initiation of improving of the especially sewage system, the inhabitants in a lot of old joint dwellings are facing with big damages in their apartments and moistures that are dangerous for the health of the inhabitants (see Fig.5.7)

5.1.3. The stage of common spaces and equipments: corridors, elevators, entrances, safety measures, and other electrical installments, priorities 8,5,4

The common spaces and equipments in the joint dwellings also needs improvements because the rare improvements done in the old joint dwellings with more than 20 years. There have been done some symbolic and cheap repairs that didn’t last much.

Fig.5.8. shows the real situation of the big number of joint dwellings. This situation is a result of lack of the management and maintenance initiatives by the owners in the majority of the joint
dwellings. The owners of some joint dwellings tried organizing themselves and starting to maintain the entrance, corridors and some repairs of the equipments, the windows of the common spaces, and the same. The big problem in joint dwellings with an average age more than 35 years needs installation of the elevators because they missed them while joint dwellings up to 35 years needs repair of the elevators.

**Fig.5.9** shows the complex of joint dwellings with more than 40 years. As it is seeable the buildings are generally Ground floor +4 floors, the construction has been made by the conventional materials, and the roofs are damaged as are executed by weak materials which nowadays needs general repairs.

![Fig 5.8: The common spaces in a joint dwelling in Prishtina](Image)
**Source:** Kosovapress newspaper

![Fig 5.9: The joint dwellings in Prishtina](Image)
**Source:** internet photo galleries

Regarding the safety measures, in general the joint dwellings are in very bad condition. Starting by the entrance, majority of them are destroyed or damaged. **Fig.5.10** shows the real situation regarding entrance in a joint dwelling. The majority of the existing joint dwellings they have no fire protection equipments neither the fire exit.

![Fig 5.10: The entrance of a condominium in Gjilan](Image)

The developers of the new joint dwellings in general they respect new modern trends of construction and other needed equipments in them. Some of them didn’t foresee the fire protection installment what is one of the basic requirements with the Law on Construction [...]

- 33 -
Based on the overview the needed refurbishment activities are considered improvements as construction works like: the thermo-insulation of the building, water and sewage system safety measures, and installation or repair of the equipments with prioritization of the elevators. There were considered as preferred activities repair of the electrical system where there are needed and installation of the automatic communication system as innovative equipments.

5.2. The living conditions in the joint dwellings in some EU countries

Based on Pedro Guertler and Winton Smith Final Report- Energy Efficiency in the Refurbishment of High-Rise Residential Buildings, done on January 2006, [25] the majority of the multi-flat housing buildings suffer from different barriers regarding maintenance and management. Many occupants in joint dwellings are tenants and their landlords usually have little or no motivation for improvement of the living conditions in them. As it was mentioned above majority of the multi flat housing i.e., nowadays joint dwellings have been constructed after second World War as social housing which housing stock during the transition phase in ex-communist states passed through the privatization process. It was much or less difficult process depending from the states. Some states didn’t end this process yet and are facing with difficulties in setting of their status. As it was described the construction quality of them was very low so their refurbishment is of utmost need. It is well known that refurbishment needs capital investment and doing so, it is needed collective agreement of the owners of the flats. Another reason that gets the process more difficult is the economic and social situation of the owners of these flats. Their economic status is a mid or low-income class of society and it is problem for capital investments. Some of these joint dwellings by creating their owner associations created the opportunities for applying in Energy Efficiency Funds that are spread worldwide the EU and world countries as protection measures against Climate Changes. One of the most important refurbishment activities in these joint dwellings it is application of energy efficiency measures in terms of improvement of the comfort, saving energy, reducing CO2 emissions and tending to improve the urban environment.

Report- Energy Efficiency in the Refurbishment of High-Rise Residential Buildings was result of the project, funded by the International Energy Agency and EuroACE (the European...
Alliance of Companies for Energy Efficiency in Buildings, \textsuperscript{[25]} which aims to investigate the energy consumption in multi-family buildings with more than four stores and it advocates the incorporation of energy efficiency measures during the overall refurbishment of the buildings as a major element of sustainable refurbishment.

This research covered the 28 countries organized into eight groups, according to socio-economic category and climate - ‘old’ EU members (EU15), ‘new’ (EU10) and accession (AS3) states presented in the Table 5.2

Table 5.2: Categorization of countries in Europe based on climate and socio-economic category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Warm climate</th>
<th>Moderate climate</th>
<th>Cold climate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EU15</td>
<td>EU10</td>
<td>AS3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member states</td>
<td>Member states</td>
<td>Non-member states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France, Greece, Italy, Portugal, Spain, United Kingdom</td>
<td>Cyprus, Malta, Malta, Malta</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium, Ireland, Luxembourg, Netherlands, United Kingdom</td>
<td>Czech Republic, Hungary, Slovak Republic, Slovenia</td>
<td>Bulgaria, Romania</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The assessment concluded the basic needed improvements in term of reducing of the heating and energy consumption like improvement of the external walls, roofs and floors regarding thermal insulation, windows’ replacement, and improvements to the heating system and many other measures as innovative technologies like external solar shading, passive solar equipments, ventilation, and lighting which are important elements in reducing of energy consumption and CO2 savings.

Based on the assessment achievable energy savings varies from 70\% to 80\% of heating demand. Incorporation of the energy efficient measures during the general refurbishment of the buildings is approximately half what it would cost as two separate processes. By reducing of energy consumption in housing buildings it is benefit multi dimensional by investing in other buildings, the highest net benefit in EU15 countries. The cost of the refurbishment investments is lowest in EU10 and AS3 countries. The highest energy saving potential is in Eastern Europe; 39\% ,and by the realization of the proposed measures it would imply a reduction of Europe’s total final energy demand of 1.5\%, resulting in approximate emissions reduction of 35 MtCO2.
The report [25] proposed the following measures to be considered during the refurbishment:

**Roof insulation** - majority of the buildings constructed in 1960 have been constructed with flat roofs while continental climate don’t prefer the flat roofs;
**Floor insulation** - the lowest floors in general are of concrete construction, needed improvement of the basement;
**Windows’ replacement** - proposed combination of double or triple, low emissive glazing, in metal, plastic or wood frames;
**Heating system** - improvements of the existing system and/or installation of new technologies in heating system in term of reduction of the energy consumption;
**Distribution** - The heat distribution measures considered changing of the thermostatic radiator valves (TRVs) and balancing valves;
**Lighting** - to be considered electric lighting in common areas by using variety of more efficient;
**Ventilation** - modernization of the system in more efficient way.

The assessment identified the following issues to be addressed:

- Using different tools for convincing the owners living in joint dwellings’ for the refurbishment where it is needed by respecting of the EPBD[7] and ESD[8];
- Respecting of the EPBD [7] requirements i.e., whenever a building with a total floor area of over 1000m² undergoes major renovation, its performance must be upgraded to meet minimum energy efficiency requirements;
- Follow Danish model- joint dwellings owners to contribute in a refurbishment fund with monthly payment;
- Considering the forms of fiscal incentives for refurbishment activities of the joint dwellings when there are applied the energy efficiency measures;
Table 5.3 shows the Energy savings, investment costs and cost of conserved in housing buildings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>U-value before (W/m²K)</th>
<th>U-value after (W/m²K)</th>
<th>Energy saved [kWh/m²a]</th>
<th>Annual investment cost [€/m²a]</th>
<th>Cost of conserved energy [€/kWh]</th>
<th>Simple payback time [years]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Walls</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>23.7%</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roof</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>24.4</td>
<td>18.4%</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Floor</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Windows</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Package</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>123.7</td>
<td>67.8%</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRVs</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>30.0%</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All of the above combined</td>
<td>141.3</td>
<td>77.4%</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.3: The energy savings, the annual investments for conserved energy and of CO2 mitigation, and payback period

Source: Pedro Guertler and Winton Smith, January 2006, Energy Efficiency in the Refurbishment of High-Rise Residential Buildings,
CHAPTER VI

ACTION PLAN FOR EFFECTIVE JOINT DWELLING ASSOCIATIONS

Project foresees the three major activities: Installation of the database about joint dwellings as a part of the housing stock; Awareness campaign; Refurbishment activities and distribution of the grants as incentives for management of the joint dwellings.

6.1. Installation of the database about joint dwellings as part of the housing stock

Part of the project is developing and installation of the database in local and central level for monitoring of the situation of the joint dwellings as an element of overall housing stock. Database would include information about the number of joint dwellings, age and the living condition in the joint dwellings with focus in applying of thermo-insulation measures in percentage per each municipality. The database would be updated permanently with records for the new joint dwellings and other developments related to them particularly per each municipality of Kosovo. /The approximately cost of the installation is around 400,000.00€./

6.2. Awareness Campaign

Awareness campaign is planned to be held in six major municipalities in Kosovo. Awareness campaign includes the workshops in the selected municipalities by training of the interested owners and by publishing and distribution of the leaflets. The trainings would be organized in one-day workshops (from 10:00h - 16:00 h). The materials of trainings would be the interpretation document of the Law i.e. Guidelines for promotion of the Law “Use, management and maintenance of the joint ownership”, the best practices of the region countries for creating of the joint dwellings and their benefits, the materials with information about importance of the energy efficiency measures in Housing Buildings, the leaflets with information for importance of the management and maintenance of the joint dwellings and possible funding forms for improving of living conditions in joint dwellings. /The approximately cost of the awareness campaign is about 14,800.00€./
The proposed list of topics to be discussed in the workshops together with the proposed list of participants they are attached in APPENDIX 4 and a model of the leaflet is attached in APPENDIX 5.

6.3. **Refurbishment activities**

Plan of refurbishment activities elaborates the proposed activities for refurbishment and the form of implementation. Incentives for the refurbishment activities are foreseen to be issued after the participation in competition which requires the owners to compete with documentation of the creating act of the joint dwelling association and a "project proposal preparation" i.e. a business plan for the first year's activities together with a list of major repairs foreseen for the next 5 years.

Refurbishment activities foreseen for the improvement of the operation and maintenance of the jointly owned property in joint dwellings include:

a) Thermo-insulation of external walls of buildings, reparation of roof and ground floor and rehabilitation or installing of new heating system;

b) Repair of the water and sewage system;

c) Repair of elevators;

d) Building of fire staircase and other safety measures where they are needed;

e) Electrical system or other equipment;

f) Installation of telecommunication commodities, depending by the case.

The model of the announcement with the detail information with conditions for gaining the grants and distribution of the grants’ procedures are described in APPENDIX 6.

The process of implementation of the refurbishment would be carried out by the municipal authorities who would also supervise the construction works. The construction company would be chosen in competition manner- respecting all procurement procedures undertaken by the municipal respective bodies. For issuing of the grants it would be established a commission in the MESP. The first 12 applicants in 6 municipalities would be winners of the grants in amount of 50% of the cost of refurbishment activities based on their range in the list. (the refurbishment activities’ cost is approximately about 445,000.00€/
6.4. Management incentives

Project foresees the incentives i.e. grants up to 500€ for newly created joint dwelling associations with aim of supporting the early starting activities of the associations.

Incentives for supporting the management of the joint dwelling associations by given financial support to them in early starting activities, they are foreseen to cover small grants (up to 500 €) for:

a) Computers;

b) Office furniture and equipments and

c) Other needed facilities considered as important

//the management incentives cover an amount of approximately 3000€/

Table 6.1- Action Plan, the approximately cost and the estimated time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Sources of verification</th>
<th>Potential financial sources</th>
<th>Approxim. Budget [€]</th>
<th>Estimated time duration [weeks]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Installation of the information system- database about joint dwellings as part of the housing stock</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Installation of the software and needed trainings for their use</td>
<td>MESP, municipalities, IT company</td>
<td>MESP and municipal Web pages</td>
<td>Kosovo Budget, municipal budget, 50,000.00+ 35x10,000.0 = 400,000.00</td>
<td>2 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1</td>
<td><strong>Information activities by information sources</strong></td>
<td>MESP, municipalities, TV, Radio and other information sources</td>
<td>MESP, municipal records, information sources</td>
<td>Kosovo Budget, municipal budget, 600.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td><strong>Awareness campaign</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1</td>
<td>Logistics</td>
<td>MESP, municipalities,</td>
<td>MESP, municipal records</td>
<td>Kosovo Budget</td>
<td>150.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2</td>
<td>Publication of leaflets</td>
<td>MESP, municipalities,</td>
<td>leaflets</td>
<td>Kosovo Budget</td>
<td>2.000.00</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.3</td>
<td>Workshops and trainings</td>
<td>MESP, municipalities</td>
<td>Recommendation s by the workshops,</td>
<td>Kosovo budget, potential donors</td>
<td>12.000.00</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Strategic planning for creating Effective Joint Dwelling Associations in Kosovo
Senior Capstone Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6.3</th>
<th>Refurbishment activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>Thermo-insulation works and rehabilitation or installing of new heating system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>Repair of the water and sewage syst.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>Repair of elevators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4</td>
<td>Building of fire staircase and other safety measures where they are needed;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.5</td>
<td>Electrical system or other equipment;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.6</td>
<td>Installation of telecommunication commodities, depending by the case</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Total budget.2 | 14.750,00 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6.4</th>
<th>Management incentives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>Distributing the computers; Office furniture and equipments; and Other needed facilities considered as important</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Total budget.4 | 2.500,00 |

| Total budget | 860.850,00 |
CHAPTER VII

DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

7.1. Concluding Assessment:

The housing stock in Kosovo in general is consisting by individual housing (more than 90%). The 10% of the Housing stock (more than 30,000 housing units [24]) is consisting by multi-flat housing buildings- joint dwellings. Currently, joint dwellings are in situation of the lack of management and maintenance. As it was elaborated once in the report, based on the data, the majority of the joint dwellings in Kosovo were constructed after Second World War as a social housing after the war. The mass construction of the joint dwellings happens especially during 70’s and 80’s. As in the other post communist states this housing stock need the general reconstruction or refurbishment. Based on research materials from literature, the majority of EU countries started with the mass refurbishment or reconstruction as an undertaken measure in respect to Energy Performance of Buildings Directive’s (EPBD) [7] and the Energy End-use Efficiency and Energy Services Directive (ESD) [8].

Kosovo even that is not member state of the Europe yet, it should be prepared to follow the experiences of the other countries. In terms of regulating the management system of the joint dwellings the government approved the Law No.03/L-091 on “Use, administration and maintenance of the joint ownership housing building” [23].

This Law proposes creating of the administration i.e. management bodies like: owners’ communion (based on the law) i.e. joint dwelling association (proposed in the project); management council and administrator (private licensed company). Establishing of these bodies are the preconditions of a functional and effective management system of the joint dwellings. The biggest risk for the implementation of the law it is bringing people together and convincing them that their organization in the joint dwelling associations is in their favor. In the Law it is not stated that creation of the “owners’ communion” [23] is compulsory or voluntary. The law proposes the way of organizing but it doesn’t have forcing or obliging dispositions. Engagement of the administrator requires establishing of the “owners’ communion” [23].
As the financial possibilities of the owners of the apartments in joint dwellings are low, for regulating a management system of the joint dwellings it is needed government initiative for stimulation. It is very difficult to wait the implementation of the Law No.03/L-091 on “Use, administration and maintenance of the joint ownership housing building”[22] to be successful without any pilot project like incentives for initiating the creation of effective joint dwelling associations.

Based on the research done during the preparing the project, there are no established management system in joint dwellings of Kosovo. Before privatization of the apartments in Kosovo the management and maintenance of the joint dwellings, it has been done by the Housing Public Enterprise. But after the privatization, The Housing Public Enterprise lost its mandate and authority for joint dwellings’ management. There happened a lot of political and social developments that effected the discontinuation of the management system of the joint dwellings. The established management bodies like owners’ society and their leading bodies, i.e. owners’ councils, in majority lost their function.

Considering this like a big problem, having the effects in the inhabitants’ lives and in environment degradation and in urban planning development, meanwhile, government initiated the drafting of the Law for regulating of the function of the so called joint-ownership housing buildings, i.e. joint dwellings. The Law is too democratic and for its implementation it is needed the stimulation forms for start. This project helps the people understand the meaning of the creation of the management system which would serve in the improvement of their living conditions by improving of the common property.

The project aims to make a linkage between local and central government with civil society, i.e. owners living in joint dwellings in term of achieving a big unique goal from which would gain all parties involved. During the analysis it was considered as very important, the use of the energy efficiency measures during the refurbishment activities of the joint dwellings. Kosovo is part of the world. The world developments and challenges would affect and Kosovo also. As other states of the world, Kosovo has to do something in term of Environment Protection and Climates Change. These challenges need a multi-orientation reaction. Housing as a big user of the Energy, can be treated as a field where it’s needed the reaction.
It should be mentioned that there have not been left away from the awareness other elements important for the normal living in the joint dwellings. The current situation regarding joint dwellings is emerging.

Choosing to do nothing is the worst scenario. People living in the joint dwellings would continue facing with different difficulties harming their day-to-day functioning even there would appear some initiatives of self-organization.

Choosing to do something is better than doing nothing. The least thing that can be undertaken by the government is awareness campaign for importance of the management and maintenance of the common areas in joint dwellings as inherent part of their individual housing units i.e. apartments.

Choosing the investing of this project it means initiating the functioning of the management and maintenance system. It would help people understand the importance of the functioning of the management and maintenance system. It would serve in improving of the living conditions in their joint dwellings and understand their role in Environment Protection and energy saving starting by individual activities.

Having in consideration the government difficulties regarding the financing, the project foresees the cooperation with donors especially energy efficiency funding instruments and partly by the owners. It is planned to serve as a pilot project having in the consideration the importance of the foreseen activities in front of the weak financing sources.

Based on the data and findings it can be concluded that this project have multi-disciplinary benefits as described in the Chapter II. It would serve as a model that would teach people starting thinking about how to improve the living conditions in the joint dwellings and what are the benefits of self-organizing into “Joint Dwelling Associations”. Because of low economic development of the country and lack of the loan possibilities, this project is a good possibility for initiating of the management system of the joint dwellings in Kosovo which are in very bad situation.

7.2. Primary and secondary Recommendations:

The primary general recommendations delivered from the project:

- Enforcement of the Laws and other government policies -with some small practical projects as pilot project like an awareness campaign activity:
Based on the good practices from the countries with similar past, small projects are considered the best tools for enforcement of any government policy. They could serve as a model for further developments regarding the particular field. The owners of the apartments in joint dwellings aren’t aware with importance of the well management of their joint property. With some pilot project for some conditional improvements, it was considered the effect tool for start.

- Institutional capacity building regarding housing and increasing of the cooperation between institutions vertically and horizontally- more joint activities local-central level for achieving of an state objective:

Current institutional structure engaged for housing is not in the stage to deal with the problems and the obstacles regarding housing. In central level there are currently two permanent officers engaged for housing. This structure need to be completed with human resources and also with professional capacities. Based on the planned organizational structure of the Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning, the Housing Division is planned to be consisted by the sector of housing policies, sector for social housing and sector for management of the joint dwellings. Currently the housing division consists from two sectors with one officer per each. So, it is needed the structure engaged for housing issues to be empowered at least with four officers. In local government there are not established the institutional structures for housing. In general with housing problems deal the directorate for Urbanism and Spatial Planning and directorate for Health and Social Welfare.

- Establishing of the electronic system- installation of the database in local and central level for recording and management of the information for housing situation, as an urgent need:

As in other fields, there is no installed any database for recording and managing of the data about housing developments. This database would help the institutions to follow the developments in the field also help in the projections of future developments regarding housing by proposing the proper housing policies.

The secondary Recommendations delivered from the project:

- Increasing of the involvement of the civil society in identification of the policies:

By organizing of themselves in Joint Dwellings’ Associations, the owners of the apartments in joint dwellings can be part of the policy making. They can actively participate by suggestions of the needed policies in term of the improvement of their living conditions and housing in general.
Increasing of the people awareness with world challenges and state obligations in front of them:

Awareness campaigns are good for informing of the people with importance of any issue. There are identified the world challenges by the several international institutions. The people should be aware with those world challenges. One of the most challenging issues in the world nowadays it’s Climate Change. People don’t know their role in Protection against the Climate Change. The awareness campaign is the proper tool for the information.

Creating of the different fiscal opportunities for housing by cooperation between the government and banks:

Different forms of the cooperation between government and banks are a good opportunity for enforcement of any policy that government wants to undertake. The government could reduce the loans interests of the banks and offering soft loans for any improvements in the Housing stock to the inhabitants or guarantee for the international loans for big projects.

Harmonization of the legislative framework:

It is needed to have harmonization between the legislative dispositions relating to the similar issues. Law No.03/L-091 on “Use, administration and maintenance of the joint ownership housing building” has to be harmonized with the Law No. 03/L-154 on” Property and other real rights”[ which among other property issues, aims to regulate the joint ownership in the housing buildings. It is subject of regulation of the Law No. 03/L-091 also. Some dispositions propose different tools for the same issues. The Law No.03/L-091 on “Use, administration and maintenance of the joint ownership housing building” was initiated in the time when didn’t exist any legislative mechanism which would regulate the management and maintenance of the joint ownership buildings- Joint dwellings. The Law No. 03/L-154 on” Property and other real rights” was approved after the Law No. 03/L-091 having no consideration the dispositions of the Law No.03/L-091.
7. References:

1. Administrative Instruction No.09/2008 on Energy Audits, Ministry of Energy and Mining, Kosovo

2. AKEREE presentation “Praktika të zbatimit të Eficiencës së Energjisë në mjediset urbane” (Experiences of implementation of Energy Efficiency in urban areas), prepared by Isa Elshani, Maliq Pireci and Besim Veselaj for workshop “Rëndësia e kursimit të energjisë në mbrojtjen e mjedisit urban” (the importance of energy saving in protection of urban area), 2008

3. Bulgarian Housing Association activity documents available on http://www.managenergy.net/


5. Case-studies doc. available on http://www.buildingforlife.org/


9. EI-Education guidebook on energy intelligent retrofitting, Energy Intelligent program document

10. ENERGY EFFICIENCY IN HOUSING, Research Note 00/24 28 March 2000, Scottish Parliament

11. ENERGY GLOBE Award process available on http://www.energyglobe.com/


14. EU funding projects/Energy/, available on http://www.cecodhas.org/


16. Homes for the future: more affordable, more sustainable, Presented to Parliament by The Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government by Command of Her Majesty July 2007

17. Institute for housing and environment, Germany publications available on http://www.iwu.de/official page of IWU

19. IWU Germany & OPUS Bergen AS Norway, 1997, *Handbook on Management of Condominiums* - the city of Warsaw, the city of Bialystok (Poland-the housing policy project)


21. Law No 2004/14 on “Construction”, available on Official gazette of Kosovo

22. Law No. 03/L-154 on” Property and other real rights”[

23. Law No.03/L-091 on “Use, administration and maintenance of the joint ownership housing building”, available on Official gazette of Kosovo

24. Report on Housing Situation 2006/done by the Housing and Construction Department/


26. Presentation of TONKA GRGIČ, B.Sc. (Arch), December 2008, on behalf of The Public Housing Fund of the Municipality of Ljubljana about LOW ENERGY AND PASSIVE HOUSING


29. Thomas Friedman, 2007, "*Hot, Flat and Crowded*"

30. UN Millenium goals REPORTS, available on http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/

31. UNECE publication, 2006, *Guidelines on Social housing*

32. UNECE publication, *Guidelines on condominium ownership of housing for countries in transition*

APPENDIX 1

The information about the consultants, the committee members:

3.1. Kadir Hyseini (1967), first minister’s political Adviser in Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning. He can be a adviser referring to the Ministry’s priorities and regarding the potential sources of finance. His education consist by: Medicine, University of Pristine; Specialist of Family Medicine; Master Studies in Medical Management a PHD studies in Management in University of Tirana

Tel. 044/132-880, 038/517-845
0280/320-413
Email: kadir@hotmail.com
kadir.hyseini@ks-gov.net

3.2. Muhamet Malsiu (1963), Director of Environment Department in Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning, primarily working as Environmental Inspector and from 2005 Head of Environmental Inspectorate before becoming the director of the Environment Department in 2007. He will help me treating Administration and maintenance of the Housing Stock as Environmental Protection Measure. He is the Engineer of Technology, finished in University of Pristine and he finished Master studies in Lancaster University, UK, for Management and the Environment.

Tel. 044/402 125, 038/211 683
038/211 716
Email: muhamet.malsiu@ks-gov.net
mmalsiu@yahoo.com
3.3.Maliq Pireci,(1970), Director of Kosovar Association for Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency – AKEREE, Graduate Engineer of Machinery in University of Prishtina, Certificated by the European Agency for Reconstruction and Eptisa for International Introduction to Energy Auditing ,Certificated by GTZ - MMS, Prishtina for using the thermo graphics to assess the heat losses in buildings administrated by the local governments, certificated by Institute “Riinvest”, Prishtina for increasing the capacity building on energy auditing and managing the energy on the local level. He is an energy efficiency expert, experienced in street lighting efficiency, public building/household efficiency, including knowledge and information’s about energy legislation and regulations, strong capacities in technical standards and regulations for energy efficiency, experienced in managing the implementation of energy efficiency and renewable energy projects, very good knowledge about the current situation, conditions and relevant actors for energy efficiency and renewable energy sector in Kosovo. He would help me about data for the heat losses in buildings and with information about technical elements of the thermo-insulation in housing buildings by respecting of energy efficiency.

Tel. 044/ 289 112, 029/ 234 944

Email: maliq.pireci@hotmail.com

mpireci@gmail.com

3.4.Iris Behr, German Senior legal consultant who did work for MESP 2005 and 2007/08 assisting in drafting the Kosovo Construction , the MESP Housing Policy Document and who consulted in respect to various legal documents prepared by MESP. In Germany she is a senior researcher at IWU-www.iwu.de .Her special expertise is local housing policy, management of housing companies and energy efficiency instruments (law, finances, administration, and good governance). She is experienced in leading national and EU funded projects (Poland, Estonia, Bulgaria, Ukraine, Russia) dealing with housing (rental housing and condominium) and energy issues.

Tel. 0049 0151 2904 40 and 0049 6151 60 1256

Email: i.behr@iwu.de

iris.behr@gmx.de
APPENDIX 2

Questions for interview

No of Interview: _________              Name of the interviewer: _______________

Data of interview: _________              Location:__________

1) Apartments Area m² _______

2) Property status:
   a) Owner.
   b) Tenant.

3) The age of the Joint dwelling
   a) 35-40 years
   b) Up to 30 years
   c) Built after 1998

4. How would you list by the priority the need for improvements in the joint dwelling?
   a. Improving of thermo-insulation in facades.............................1 2 3 4 5
   b. Repair of the sewage and water installation............................1 2 3 4 5
   c. Change of the windows........................................................1 2 3 4 5
   d. Repair of the roof.............................................................1 2 3 4 5
   e. Repair of the elevators/installation of them where they don’t exist.................................................................1 2 3 4 5
   f. Safety measures/Fire protection...............................................1 2 3 4 5
   g. Painting and repair of the common spaces...............................1 2 3 4 5
   h. Repair of the main entrance and electrical equipments............1 2 3 4 5
   i. Other________________________________________________________1 2 3 4 5

5. Does there exist the organized management of the common spaces, who is responsible for maintenance?
   a.) Yes                                 b.) No

   Other___________________________________________________________

   a) Did you hear for the Law on” Use, administration and maintenance of the building joint ownership”?
      a) Yes                                 b) No

6. Do You think that self-organization in Owners Association and establishing of the management bodies based on the Law would help You?
   a.) Yes                                 b.) No

   Other___________________________________________________________

7. Do You think that stimulation measures i.e. government incentives would help you for self- organizing of the owners of the apartments in your joint dwelling in Joint Dwelling association and which stimulation measures would you propose?

   ________________________________

8. Notes:__________________________________________________________
**APPENDIX 3**

List of topics to be treated in the one day (10:00-16:00 h) workshops:

1. **PRIVATE OWNERSHIP IN MULTI-UNIT JOINT DWELLINGS**
   1.1. Some basic definitions
   1.2. Ownership in joint dwellings

2. **NATIONAL FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS FOR JOINT DWELLINGS**
   2.1. Joint dwelling’s ownership in a national housing strategy
   2.2. Legal framework
   2.3. Institutional framework

3. **MUNICIPAL FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS FOR THE EFFECTIVE OPERATION OF JOINT DWELLINGS**
   3.1. Joint dwelling’s ownership in municipal housing policy
   3.2. Establishing and supporting owners’ associations

4. **OWNERS’ ASSOCIATIONS – STATUTES AND ORGANIZATION**
   4.1. Statutes and agreements
   4.2. Organization of an owners’ association
   4.3. Meetings
   4.5. Establishing an owners’ association

5. **OWNERS’ ASSOCIATIONS – MANAGEMENT AND OPERATION**
   5.1. Management of a jointly owned property
   5.2. Financial management
   5.3. Operations, maintenance and repairs

6. **SOME PRACTICAL ADVICES FOR NEW JOINT DWELLINGS’ ASSOCIATIONS**
   6.1. Best practices in joint dwelling management and maintenance, good functional joint dwellings associations

7. **THE ENERGY EFFICIENCY MEASURES IN THE JOINT DWELLINGS**
   7.1. The role of the energy efficiency measures as refurbishment needed activity
   7.2. The benefits of applying of energy efficiency measures
   7.3. Actual world trends and programs for energy efficiency in housing
   7.3. The emergent energy efficiency measures to be considered during refurbishment of old joint dwellings

**List of the participants:**
- MESP participants - up to 5 participants
- Municipality participants - up to 4 participants
- The delegates from a number of joint dwellings, district delegates
- Civil Society
- NGO-s
- International institutions acting in Kosovo
- Some licensed companies for administration and maintenance of joint dwellings
- Construction companies

**Panelists:**
- Two MESP representatives, an international expert and a municipal representative
APPENDIX 4
The model of the leaflet

SOME DEFINITIONS:

**JOINT DWELLING** - is independent building with more than two suitable units foreseen for housing, respectively for housing and commercial activities owned by more than one owner

**JOINT DWELLING ASSOCIATION – owners’ association**, is a non compulsory legal entity that acts on behalf of all owners of the condominium

**ADMINSITRATOR** – is a legal entity licensed in Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning for activity of management and maintenance of condominium

**How can be used joint ownership?**
The owner is obliged to use joint ownership in compliance with destination and by respecting the rights of others

**How can be used the individual part?**
In condominiums, all owners shall realize their ownership right to the housing building unit so that other building unit owners are not disturbed.

**Which are the decisions making bodies?**
Owners’ association or representative of the owners and selected administering bodies such as administering council and the administrator are responsible for decision making.

**How are regulated relations, rights, obligation between owners?**
Relation, rights, obligation as well as the percentage in joint ownership, owners regulate with Contracts for Joint ownership bonded between all owners.

---

**Why it is needed the condominium-owners’ association and how it functions?**
Condominium association is a body that consists by all owners of the individual housing unit of the building. Condominium association it is needed for better representing of their rights and better management of the condominiums.

**What are the benefits of organizing in the condominium association?**
A condominium association can contribute in the policy making by making public of their requirements about condominium; they can gain funds by applying with projects in several funding organizations; they can organize better the management and maintenance and contribute in their future life conditions.

**Who is the administrator and administering council?**
When the housing building has more than two owners the owners have to choose an administrator. Administrator is authorized and represents the owners. The right to become the
Can the condominium association cancel the contract with administrator and under which conditions?

Each contracting party of management work performance have right that by unilateral decision to be released from the contract, with obligation to inform the other party within limited period at least three (3) months, since the day of denunciation. Within this period, the owners will select new administrator.

What means the house rules?

House rules determine the essential understanding rules adopted by the condominium association with aim to promote the harmonious living among owners or tenants.

Payment modalities of the management expenses?

Based on the owners agreement part of the management plan it is the price of monthly payment in the reserve fund for the management and maintenance expenses. The participation amount in the reserve fund is set in the way that every owner pays depending of the proportional percentage in the joint ownership if they don’t agree differently by contract.

Who manage the reserve fund?

With financial means of reserve fund manage the administrator. The Administrator should insure that all prepay of the owners for reserve fund, to be managed in Special banking account. If the administrator manages more than one condominium he is obliged to manage the reserve fund in the separate accounts.

What is the benefit of the refurbishment in old condominiums?

The old condominiums need the major refurbishment in term of improving of the living conditions in them and as an economic element because by applying of energy saving measures during the refurbishment it would cause the reducing of energy consumption i.e. energy bills.

Why is important the application of the thermo-insulation measures during refurbishment of the condominium?

During refurbishment is of the utmost importance including the thermo-insulation measures because it would increase the living comfort also it would affect the reducing of energy cost.

As the biggest users of energy, housing is considered as a big polluter and CO2 emitter.

How the refurbishment of condominiums could contribute in energy savings and reduction of CO2 emissions as measure against Climate changes?

Application of the energy saving measures during the refurbishment would cause the reduction of the energy consumption meanwhile the reduction of the CO2 emissions which is a precondition for protection against Climate changes.

adress/ tel.
APPENDIX 5

Announcement

GRANTS FOR REFURBISHMENT OF THE JOINT DWELLINGS AND MANAGEMENT OF THEM

In term of enforcing the implementation of the Law on “Use, administration and maintenance of the housing joint ownership buildings” and initiating the creating of the efficient management system of the housing joint-ownership buildings-joint dwellings, Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning in cooperation with municipalities initiated giving incentives for refurbishment of the joint dwellings and management incentives

Refurbishment grants

Who is eligible for a grant?

Refurbishment grants are available for improvements, which are required in term of improving of the living conditions and applying of energy efficiency measures as an environmental protection measures.

The grants are giving in competition where for eligibility for the grants they are required:

- Creating of the joint dwelling association and establishing the management council as required in the respective law;
- Preparing the project proposal with the major refurbishment activities of the joint dwelling and action plan for 5 years;
- Documentation which proves the registering of the created joint dwelling association; and
- The document of availability of the owners for covering of the 50% of the investments.

Please note: You have to wait until you have received written approval because the availability of the grants depends by financial possibilities.

How much grant will be paid?

The first four winners will gain maximum grant which is 20,000 € for each joint dwelling Association; (see activities described a) to f) and management incentives)

The second two winners will gain grant of 19.100 € for each joint dwelling association; (see activities described a) to d))

The third three winners will gain grant of 17.600€ for each joint dwelling association; (see activities described a) to c))

The fourth three winners will gain grant of 17.500€ for each joint dwelling association; (see activities described a) and b))
Refurbishment activities foreseen for the improvement of the operation and maintenance of the jointly owned property in the joint dwellings, include:

- **g)** Thermo-insulation of external walls of buildings, reparation of roof and ground floor and rehabilitation or installing of new heating system –50% of 30,000€;
- **h)** Repair of the water and sewage system - 50% of 5,000€
- **i)** Repair of elevators- 50% of 100€;
- **j)** Building of fire staircase and other safety measures where they are needed- 50% of 3,000€;
- **k)** Electrical system or other equipment- 50% of 200€;
- **l)** Installation of telecommunication commodities, depending by the case- 50% of 500€; and

Management incentives 500€ for four first winners

**What is the procedure?**

A full application procedure includes submitting of an application form, a Project Proposal together with Action Plan, joint dwelling association establishing Act and document for availability of the joint dwellings association for participating in investments with 50% and planning permission for refurbishment or a certificate of lawful use.

When the documents will be received, the council will decide for your application and inform you about acceptance or refuse of the request and with the amount of grant available, within 30 days.