American University of Kosovo
School of Public Services
&
Rochester Institute of Technology
Master of Science Degree in Public Administration

“Donor Coordination in Kosovo 2010-2020”
by
Fatlinda NITAJ-REXHAJ

May 22, 2012
Presentation Outline

• Sectors which received the largest amount 1999-2007
• Issues that Government of Kosovo need to undertake in coordination of donations
• Kosovo’s coordination institutions Description of current situation of donor coordination
• Financial instruments
• Donor Coordination at the International and Regional level
• Research methodology and survey results
• Government and Donor Organization Questionnaire
• Major Recommendations
• Further Recommendations & Conclusions
The sectors which received the largest external financing 1999-2007 public and the private sector

- Public Administration: 21%
- Energy: 17%
- Private Sector Development: 11%
- Health and Social Welfare: 5%
- Transport and Infrastructure: 4%
- Agriculture and Rural Development: 4%
- Education and Science: 5%
- Housing: 7%
- Budget: 7%
- Democratic Governance / Local Administration: 21%
- Other: 12%
- Water: 4%
Issues identified for Government of Kosovo in coordination of donations

- Lack of commitment in aid effectiveness
- Lack of leadership on donor coordination
- Lack of communication and leadership in the process
Project’s main recommendations

- Show leadership on donor coordination: 38%
- Communication and leadership in this process: 23%
- No leadership is necessary: 0%
- None of the above: 0%
- Show more commitment toward aid effectiveness: 39%
Key issues for Government and other stakeholders

• *To improve the coordination:*

• There should be improved coordination and communication

• Government strengthen the coordination mechanism

• Be an active party in this process
To improve the coordination and communication

Coordination Communication
(34 Respondents)

- Ineffective communication takes place 50%
- Effective Communication takes place 6%
- Reasonable level of team work and communication 44%
Kosovo’s coordination institutions

Organisational Structure - Ministry of European Integration

Cabinet of the Minister

Minister

Deputy Ministers

Secretary General

Office of Budget and Finance
Office of Procurement
Office of Communication and Information
Office of Archives
Internal Audit
Certification Officer

Department of Strategy and Coordination
  Division of Strategy and Analysis
  Division of Management of Information Systems and Databases
  Division of Institutional Building

Department of Governance
  Division of Public Administration
  Division of Rule of Law

Department of Economics and Market
  Division of Internal Market and Trade
  Division of Economic Development, SMEs, and Cross - Border Cooperation

Department of Infrastructures and Natural Resources
  Division of Environment, Energy and Mining

Department of Social Policies, Education and Health

Department of Agriculture, Food Safety and Rural Development

Legal Department
  Division of Approximation of National Legislation with the acquis
  Division of Coordination of Translation of acquis

Department of Central Administration
  Division of Human Resources
  Division of Information Technology
  Division of General Services
Current situation of donor coordination

• High Level Forum
• Sector Working Groups
• Sub-Sector Working Groups

Financial instruments
• Instrument for Pre Accession Assistance (IPA)
• TAIEX – Technical Assistance and Information Exchange
• Twinning Instrument
Donor Coordination at the International and Regional level

- Albania case
- Macedonia case
- Montenegro case
- Serbia case
- Bosnia and Herzegovina case
Donor Coordination at the International level

Improved coordination among donors is an important step toward improving the impact of development assistance globally.
Research methodology and survey results

• Two standardized questionnaires & face to face interviews:

• Government officials questionnaires - prepared in English and Albanian in order to give possibility to respond in the language that better fit to them (40 government officials intended respondents, while 34 of them responded)

• (All 18 Ministries of the Government of Kosovo)

• Donor community questionnaires (English) representatives 20 intended respondent, while 18 of them responded (World Bank, KWF, USAID, EUO, CDC, GIZ, UNICEF, DFID, UNFPA, CIM-IF, ADA, British Council, UNDP, FAO, JICA, WHO, SIDA, Lux-Development, Embassy of France, Italian Cooperation, Embassies from other EU Member States)
Survey results Government questionnaire
(34 respondents)

Gender
(34 Respondents)

- Male: 71%
- Female: 29%

Age group
(34 Respondents)

- 20 - 30: 15%
- 31 - 40: 59%
- 41 - 50: 20%
- 51 - 60: 6%
- 60+: 0%

Position
(34 Respondents)

- Menagerial: 73%
- Administrative: 15%
- Technical: 3%
- Financial: 0%
- Other: 9%
- HR: 0%
Survey results - Government questionnaire

**Level of Coordination of the Donor Activity from 1999 - 2010 (34 respondents)**

- Excellent: 0%
- Good: 15%
- Satisfactory: 47%
- Weak: 35%
- Unsatisfactory: 3%

**Trained Coordination Personnel at the Ministries (34 respondents)**

- Very much: 3%
- Yes: 18%
- Reasonably: 50%
- Not too much: 26%
- Not at all: 3%

**Effective Communication takes place (34 Respondents)**

- Effective Communication takes place: 6%
- Reasonable level of team work and communication: 44%
- Ineffective communication takes place: 50%
Survey results - Government questionnaire

How Aid Management Platform is perceived by Government Officials?
(34 Respondents)

- Now is being continuously used by Government and donors: 43%
- Relatively relevant to be used: 27%
- Not being used at all: 3%
- Not being continuously used by Government and donor community: 15%

Changes experienced in Goverment Sectors in time period from 1999 - 2010 (34 Respondents)

- Continuation of the donor support at the specific sector: 59%
- Less donations came across in the sector: 6%
- More donations at the beginning: 12%
- Donors show a kind of non interest to support the sector: 14%
- Reasonable donor support at the sector: 9%

More donations at the beginning 12%
Continuation of the donor support at the specific sector 59%
Less donations came across in the sector 6%
Donors show a kind of non interest to support the sector 14%
Reasonable donor support at the sector 9%
Now is being continuously used by Government and donors 43%
Relatively relevant to be used 27%
Not being used at all 3%
Not being continuously used by Government and donor community 15%
Survey results - Government questionnaire

**Government expectations for Donor Support in the Future**
(34 Respondents)

- Not much: 12%
- Not at all: 0%
- Somewhat: 18%
- Highly: 20%
- Quite a lot: 50%

**Proposed actions that Government of Kosovo should undertake to enhance donor coordination assistance**
(34 Respondents)

- Communication and leadership in this process: 23%
- Show more commitment toward aid effectiveness: 39%
- No leadership is necessary: 0%
- Non of the above: 0%
- Show leadership on donor coordination: 38%
Survey results (18 respondents)
Donor questionnaire

Gender
(18 Respondents)

- Male: 38%
- Female: 62%

Age group
(18 Respondents)

- 20 - 30: 0%
- 31 - 40: 44%
- 41 - 50: 39%
- 51 - 60: 6%
- 60+: 11%
Survey results (18 respondents)
Donor questionnaire

Type of Donor Organization
(18 Respondents)

- European Government Agency: 23%
- Non-European Government Agency: 8%
- Foundations: 0%
- Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO-s): 8%
- International Institutions: 38%
- Other: 23%

Reasons for Poor Coordination
(18 respondents)

- Aid increases to the cost to donors and partner countries: 9%
- Significantly reduces the values of aid: 9%
- Country not able to establish a single budgetary framework: 9%
- All of the above mentioned: 64%
- Other: 9%
Survey results (18 respondents)
Donor questionnaire

Should the Government of Kosovo undertake the coordination of donations?
(18 Respondents)
- Strongly agree: 67%
- Agree: 33%
- Nor agree nor disagree: 0%
- Disagree: 0%
- Strongly disagree: 0%

How has the assistance given from 1999 till 2011 helped communities in Kosovo?
(18 Respondents)
- Helped a lot: 12%
- Helped in certain level: 88%
- Didn't help so much: 0%
- Didn't help: 0%
Survey results (18 respondents)

Donor questionnaire

Level of satisfaction with management of donor financial assistance by Kosovo Institutions so far (18 respondents)

- Very good: 0%
- At the satisfied level: 5%
- Relatively good: 27%
- Do not know: 5%
- Not good: 21%
- Good: 42%

Donor clear view to intervene with assistance in the past years (18 Respondents)

- Yes very clear view: 31%
- Yes satisfactory: 46%
- Sometimes: 23%
- Not a clear view: 0%
- Not at all: 0%
Survey results (18 respondents)
Donor questionnaire

Reason for intervention (18 Respondents)
- Socio-economic situation: 54%
- Country policies: 28%
- Political situation: 18%

Government’s main medium-term planning document (18 Respondents)
- Sector Strategy: 50%
- Medium term expenditure framework: 38%
- New Economic Development Vision 2011-2014: 4%
- European Partnership Action Plan: 8%
Survey results (18 respondents)

Donor questionnaire

In terms of aid effectiveness what should Kosovo make use of?
(18 Respondents)

- Alignment of aid to national development strategies: 35%
- More unified government policies and strategies to support aid alignment: 25%
- Reliable public financial management systems: 5%
- Procurement and public financial management: 0%
- All of the mentioned above: 35%

Top three of the following for improvement in donor coordination
(18 Respondents)

- Grater detailed attention with original agreement: 21%
- Independent annual reviews ensuring effectiveness: 17%
- Improve monitoring technicalities and mechanisms: 21%
- Stronger framework reporting – Paris Declaration: 10%
- Improved Government systems, transparency and human capital: 2%
- Increase the effectiveness of communication on channels: 29%
Survey results (18 respondents)

Donor questionnaire

**How should Kosovo improve upon its project evaluation process (18 respondents)**

- Better specifications of requirements for a particular period of time: 23%
- Setting and meeting specific goals: 41%
- Increased number of consultations between donor and donor and government: 14%
- More regular, accurate and concise documentary reporting: 14%
- Other: 8%

**Is Kosovo showing a strong and balanced mechanism that support accountability (18 respondents)**

- Presently Kosovo does not have a mutual accountability structure in place: 35%
- Not even attempted to undertake a mutual assessment: 0%
- No: 5%
- Both donors and partner countries should be accountable: 55%
- Kosovo should be accountable to its public for aid effectiveness: 5%
Survey results (18 respondents)
Donor questionnaire

Top 5 areas that need attention in the future
(18 Respondents)

- Social Welfare: 12%
- Education: 15%
- Judiciary: 14%
- Energy: 14%
- Environment: 14%

Other areas:
- Industry: 3%
- Trade: 5%
- Health: 12%
- Democratic Governance: 1%
- Agriculture: 1%
- Transport: 0%
- Telecommunications: 0%
- Culture & Arts: 0%
- Human, minorities, gender rights: 10%
- Economic growth and democratic reform: 1%
Recommendations -I-

• 1. The Government should increase the effectiveness of communication channels

This will provide the Government to establish and strengthen mechanisms for continues communication among it’s institutions, at the sector level with the relevant bilateral and multilateral donor.

• 2. Enhance the monitoring and reporting system between Government and the Donor Community

This will assist the Government and Donor Community to increase the actual level of monitoring and reporting system, which is the most in need for proper and accurate transparency of spending and all the donations given to Kosovo.

3. The Government should show more effective leadership and commitment when coordinating the foreign assistance

This is a must for Government of Kosovo in order to take the leadership role in coordinating the foreign assistance by showing commitment in coordination and definitely leading to the strategy in donor coordination.
Recommendations -II-

4. The Government should have a satisfactory result oriented framework

   It will help the Government to draft it’s own Strategy on Donor Coordination and make the alignment of aid

5. The Government and Donors should set a framework on meeting specific goals

   This will assure transparency and accountability if the setting and meeting specific goals will be achieved

6. The Government should have a stronger and more balanced mechanism to support accountability

   By being accurate and accountable in terms of aid effectiveness

7. The Government should identify priorities

   To benefit from external assistance and promote donor coordination
8. The Government should have reliable public financial management systems
   This will increase financial system

9. Increase the aid effectiveness
   There should be alignment of aid to national development strategies

10. There should be alignment of aid flow on national priorities
    This will be achieved when country authorities present accurate and comprehensive budget report to the Parliament and Citizens

11. Government should strengthen its mechanism on reporting and fulfillment of Paris Declaration indicators

12. Government of Kosovo should draft its long term strategy on Donor Coordination
    Strategy on Donor Coordination for the next ten years
Further recommendations & Conclusions

• Ministry for European Integration as a leading body in the coordination of foreign assistance should strengthen its capacities in aid coordination

• There should be continues capacity building programs offered by Kosovo Institute for Public Administration to the staff in the Ministry of European Integration and other line Ministries that are involved in donor coordination process

• Further support and enhance the capacities of the staff at Municipal level to manage the foreign assistance and grants dedicated to development
Further recommendations & Conclusions

- Government of Kosovo should have a communication strategy or plan for the coordination of donor financial assistance

- More day to day meetings as the sector level with donor community to better understanding the needs

- Participation in regional and international events for the staff that deals with the donor coordination assistance at the Government level
Acknowledgements

Thank you for your attention!
Questions?

Fatlinda.Nitaj@rks-gov.net; fatlinda.nitaj@gmail.com
tel: +377(0)44 431 288