The Editorial Decision in Photography

Lyn Adams

Follow this and additional works at: http://scholarworks.rit.edu/theses

Recommended Citation

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Thesis/Dissertation Collections at RIT Scholar Works. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses by an authorized administrator of RIT Scholar Works. For more information, please contact ritscholarworks@rit.edu.
ROCHESTER INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

COLLEGE OF GRAPHIC ARTS AND PHOTOGRAPHY

PERMISSION FORM

Title of Thesis THE EDITORIAL DECISION IN PHOTOGRAPHY

I hereby (grant, deny) permission to the Wallace Memorial Library, of R.I.T., to reproduce my thesis in whole or in part. Any reproduction will not be for commercial use or profit.

OR

I prefer to be contacted each time a request for reproduction is made. I can be reached at the following address. 1012 Washington Avenue

New Orleans, La. 70130

Date August 29, 1979
THE EDITORIAL DECISION IN PHOTOGRAPHY

by

Lyn Adams

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree

MASTER OF FINE ARTS

MFA PHOTOGRAPHY PROGRAM

SCHOOL OF PHOTOGRAPHIC ARTS AND SCIENCES

ROCHESTER INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

ROCHESTER, NEW YORK

August, 1979

Bradley Hindson, Chairperson

Donald R. Anderson

Andrew Eskind
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mountain Review</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time Was</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhibition</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

A recent article in Exposure, the publication of the Society for Photographic Education, suggested that teachers have realized that creative activities for children should not be limited to the making of art, but should include talking and writing about works of art.\(^1\) This concept may well be the legacy of many academic institutions which offer MFA degrees (including degrees in photography). For while MFA candidates may primarily be concerned with producing works of art, the fear is that students might "leave their photographic education knowing only that the photographic community values print quality...\((\text{as})\) the most important aspect of photography."\(^2\)

In this thesis I attempt to come to grips with the non-technical nature of my photographic activity with a "critical" analysis of three "creative" works. This analysis and the works themselves are submitted as the "photographic thesis" in fulfillment of requirements for the MFA degree in photography. While it is recognized that MFA students should be able not only to execute works of art, but also be aware of the implications of that art, some confusion arises concerning the role of the written portion of the MFA photographic thesis. One of the pertinent
definitions of "thesis" in The Oxford English Dictionary is

A proposition laid down or stated, esp. as a theme to be discussed or proved, or to be maintained against attack....

When such a definition is applied to a body of work which is, in part, intended to be "creative" and when two modes of expression (language and photography) are involved, there is a possibility that one mode of expression may be subjugated by the other. And since the concept "thesis" is essentially verbal, the possibility is that the visual mode of expression will follow the line of the verbal.

As I did not want to put myself in the position of having to prove or illustrate a particular proposition with a thematically related group or series of photographs, I chose to present three independent creative works—a regional quarterly magazine, a photographic book and an exhibition of photographs—and then to discuss them from a critical perspective.

My thesis proposal suggests that procedures and criteria for editing photographs differ as the purposes of the material involved and/or the individual editors differ. While initially, perhaps, that proposition sounds self-evident, a good deal of the difficulty and confusion to be encountered in much of past and present photographic criticism is likely due to a failure to recognize that photography has differing functions to which different criteria might be applied. Part of the difficulty in evolving a criticism beyond the discussion of photographic hardware and techniques has been due to a general confusion about the relationship of photography to journalism, art and social sciences. If one could, as Imogen Cunningham suggested, "divide photography into its different phases and be aware that there are differences," some of the difficulty
in photographic criticism, it seems, could be alleviated. There has been a tendency to evaluate or criticize "photography" without making the allowance that it is comprised of such frequently disparate fields as journalistic, commercial, documentary, medical, scientific and personal expression photography. Thus, this paper will examine some of the choices involved and the problems inherent in the editing or the critical appraisal of three different works created by one photographer/editor in light of the purposes served by the material.

Editing, a process of evaluation and selection, is itself a form of criticism (the "art of estimating the qualities and character of literary or artistic work"). The task of a photography editor, then, is, after estimating the qualities and character of photographs, to select the best photographs for publication and/or exhibition. But what is "best" and the purpose that the "best" will serve is very much contingent on the perspective of the editor. While Susan Sontag may judge Diane Arbus' work by suggesting that in Diane Arbus "everyone...looks (in some sense) the same" and sees Arbus as putting forth a negative view of humanity, Nathan Lyons "raises another question, about what's been selected out of her work, to represent her, by someone else--perhaps her editor." With Arbus as well as numerous other photographers, critics and viewers are possibly dealing with a body of work very much influenced by the concerns of people other than the photographer. Thus, it becomes important to examine criteria for selection so that the evaluation of the work by the editor and/or critic can be inspected (and agreed with or refuted) in light of his or her own standards or framework of critical analysis.

Discussion of the three works--Mountain Review, a regional quarterly magazine of fiction, journalism, poetry, photography and art; Time Was,
a book of photographs edited from a regional photographic archives with text edited from a regional oral history program of taped interviews; and a photographic exhibition of 35 original photographs edited from a larger body of work (60 photographs)—will provide examples of some of the problems and solutions involved in the selections of specific photographs and of several different uses of photography, including photojournalism, photo-illustration and fine art photography.
I

Mountain Review

Susan Sontag's method of criticism in *On Photography*, a book which first appeared as a series of essays in *The New York Review of Books*, involves a continuous comparison of words and photography as ways of knowing. She claims, in discussing the Farm Security Administration portraits supervised by Roy Emerson Stryker, that the project was "unabashedly propagandistic," that it "implicitly defined its point of view," and that it was "idiomatic."¹ For Sontag, photography is "a means by which, precisely, anything can be said, any purpose served."² But, paradoxically, she also proposes that photography cannot create moral positions, can only help build or reinforce them when there is an already existing context of feeling and attitude.³ Thus, she separates thought (understanding) and sense-perception (seeing). Because understanding is rooted in the ability to say 'no,'" photography may be "only an invitation to fantasy and speculation."⁴ She apparently assumes that one cannot say "no" to a photograph and that speculation doesn't lead to understanding. But to Rudolf Arnheim, concerned with the visual relationships of physical things, the most pernicious idea in Western Civilization is the dichotomy between thinking and looking. Arnheim
sees such a dichotomy in Berkeley's empiricism in which image may only be particular (there can be no image of "man," only particular men), and in Piaget's separation of motor, perceptual and intellectual phases.⁵

Arnheim and Richard Zakia, the author of Perception and Photography, adapting those theories of Gestalt which influenced Bauhaus work in photography, see visual artistic activity as a process of indivisibly related forms of reasoning and thinking. Yet while photography may not be dependent on words as a way of knowing, it may also be true that as the function of photography changes, its relationship to words may change. The difference between photographs found in a journalistic article and on the wall of a gallery may be of some illustrative quality. In illustrative roles, photographs seem to be considered secondary to words. Thus for W. Eugene Smith "Ideally every photograph [in a photo essay] would fill both the artistic function and the necessity of journalism." But he also recognized that this is not realistic.⁶ Cornell Capa defines the work of the photojournalist as "the storytelling work, not the single picture of great beauty,"⁷ and according to Anthony Armstrong-Jones the photographer is "there to illustrate, like a cartoonist: to emphasize certain things perhaps, but above all to make people read the piece."⁸ According to John Morris, a former New York Times picture editor, "it's very hard to achieve the delicate intellectual balance between pictures and ideas. So often the top story of the day just defies illustration."⁹ In such an instance Eugene Smith has enjoyed illustrating the manuscript in "some very free-form way that allowed me not to illustrate one little passage...but allowed me to illustrate the feeling of the subject."¹⁰ Certainly the basic fact for the photojournalist is that words and photographs have seldom "gotten together as equals, each with his heart in it."¹¹
My realization of the difficulties of trying to combine photographs with words in an illustrative way came about through my involvement with a quarterly magazine, Mountain Review (Fig.1). The magazine developed from a one year (1973-74) National Endowment for the Arts grant for a high school writing workshop, the guidelines of which called for the publication of a journal at the termination of the grant period. There were no specifications indicated and the resultant journal or magazine might assume any form. As one of the founding editors and later the Photography and Art Editor, and the Project Director of a second NEA grant (1976-77) to publish the magazine and continue writing and photography workshops, I had a major role in helping shape the evolving character of Mountain Review.

The fact that Mountain Review attempted to be a truly regional magazine--conceived as a voice for all Appalachians, young and old, scholars and those not formally educated--dictated to a great extent its journalistic content, which then influenced my choices of illustrations. While attempting to reflect the culturally diverse Appalachian region, articles, drawings and photographs which reinforced the image of "Appalachia" as a backward place inhabited only by poor, ignorant people were excluded. It was decided early on not to limit the contents to the writings of the high school workshop since this would limit the audience and, therefore, diminish distribution possibilities, but to include a section by students in each issue. And, although the current trend seems to be for specialized interest magazines, it was felt that Mountain Review would stand a better chance of reaching a wide variety of people in the area if the subject matter were not limited to folklore, political issues or history. With a wide range of material, including journalism, fiction, poetry, reviews, interviews, art
and photography, it was felt *Mountain Review* could find its way into libraries and classrooms, as well as homes.

It quickly became evident that each issue of the magazine could easily be filled by writers from academia. But a conscious effort was made to avoid this possibility and to regularly include such pieces as "Two Boys and Their Pets" (Vol.1, No.3) (Fig.4), by a grandmother who writes stories for her grandchildren, works in her garden and goes to church. In the same issue is an article on "Urbanization" by an assistant professor of geography at a state university, who is interested in Appalachian development and problems of rural health care delivery, an essay on "Autumn in Appalachia" by a 15 year old girl and a short article by the head of the English department at a university.

The first issue of *Mountain Review* contains an article on "Bridge-sitting" ("...here in the mountainous region of Eastern Kentucky, your pastime pleasures are somewhat restricted") by a recent high school graduate and an article on "Video and Miners: Appalachia and Wales" by a Rhodes Scholar in political science who is interested "in allowing Appalachians to communicate with and learn from people in similar situations--people who were involved in or had already faced similar battles to those we face in the mountains at home."

By including articles on topics relating directly to the area within a magazine not solely containing political discussion, *Mountain Review* has the capability of being politically relevant without running the risk of scaring off potential readers. "What Is a Credit Union?" "A Report on CBS News and 17 Million Appalachian People," "The Human Side of Strip Mining," "Our Schools: Institutions of Stagnation," "Being in the Right Place at the Right Time: A Lawyer Who Became a Millionaire Handling Black Lung Cases," are not titles that might
TWO BOYS & THEIR PETS

There was two boys whose names were Joe and Jack. They had a pony they liked to ride. They would go to the store and buy candy and feed some to the pony. They would sit on the pony and go to the store and buy candy. One day one of the boys gave the pony some poisoning. It was fatal. The other boy died. The boys were left to care for the pony. They were never able to do it. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought home some candy for their pony. The boys were never able to do it. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony. One day they went to a house and fed the pony. The boys were sent to jail. The pony was soon allowed to go. But the boys never went to jail. They always brought back some candy for their pony.
immediately appeal to everyone. Yet the theory was that a magazine offering a variety of material would reach those who might never be exposed to such journalism.

The photography used as illustration for articles and fiction has been from a variety of sources. Not only have photographs been made to illustrate particular articles, but "found" photographs have also been used as illustration. As I realized that photographs from the Archives at which I work often seemed somehow illustrative or suggestive of a particular article, or aspects of an article or story, or seemed more general than particular in nature, I began illustrating articles and fiction with such photographs. Since I did not want to impose particular creeds on the magazine, but felt that I should merely try to present the spectrum of views held by contributors, I felt that I should only resort to taking photographs, or using my own file photographs, for illustration when no others could be located, or when deadlines were imminent.

With Mountain Review the text has usually come first and only later are the photographs sought as illustration of the text--sometimes in a literal way and sometimes in a more abstract way. Thus it has often been necessary to overlook a lack of artistic merit or other considerations in order to use a photograph that is able to offer a particular kind of information. As Eugene Smith admitted, "Sometimes I have used pictures...that I simply had not been able to bring to the very highest of photographic standards, but that I found to be essential for the book."13

An article in Mountain Review, "TVA Coal Industry Villain or Victim?" (Vol.3, No.1), that deals with the history of the Tennessee Valley Authority and its coal purchasing practices serves as an example of
Chapter VIII

In the last days of the summer, we moved into the new house and got some of the work done on it. The house was a bit of a mess, but it was ours. We spent a lot of time painting and cleaning. We also planted some flowers and bushes. It was a lot of work, but we were happy to be there. We spent a lot of time in the backyard, playing and having picnics. We also spent a lot of time in the kitchen, cooking and eating.

Chapter IX

In the fall, we moved into the new house and got some of the work done on it. The house was a bit of a mess, but it was ours. We spent a lot of time painting and cleaning. We also planted some flowers and bushes. It was a lot of work, but we were happy to be there. We spent a lot of time in the backyard, playing and having picnics. We also spent a lot of time in the kitchen, cooking and eating.

The Hay Field

Edward Waters

The small town of Hayfield is nestled in the heart of the Midwest, surrounded by rolling hills and lush farmland. The sleepy town is known for its friendly residents and its vibrant community spirit. In the quiet streets of Hayfield, one can hear the distant rumble of a train and the gentle chirping of birds. The town is essentially a farming community, with most of its residents working in agriculture or related fields. Hayfield is a place where time seems to stand still, where life moves at a slower pace.

Doug Rea

Doug Rea is a photographer who has covered a wide range of topics and events. His work has appeared in numerous publications and he has won several awards for his photography. He is known for his ability to capture the essence of a place and its people.

Photography Portfolio

Doug Rea's Photography Portfolio is a visual journey through his work. It features a variety of subjects, from landscapes to portraits, and showcases his skill in capturing the beauty of ordinary moments.

Fig. 5

The Hay Field

Edward Waters

The small town of Hayfield is nestled in the heart of the Midwest, surrounded by rolling hills and lush farmland. The sleepy town is known for its friendly residents and its vibrant community spirit. In the quiet streets of Hayfield, one can hear the distant rumble of a train and the gentle chirping of birds. The town is essentially a farming community, with most of its residents working in agriculture or related fields. Hayfield is a place where time seems to stand still, where life moves at a slower pace.

Doug Rea

Doug Rea is a photographer who has covered a wide range of topics and events. His work has appeared in numerous publications and he has won several awards for his photography. He is known for his ability to capture the essence of a place and its people.

Photography Portfolio

Doug Rea's Photography Portfolio is a visual journey through his work. It features a variety of subjects, from landscapes to portraits, and showcases his skill in capturing the beauty of ordinary moments.

Fig. 5
Writing Workshop

Scotia.

Pannly Hobson
Photography Portfolio
Two Statements Heard By The Presidential Reorganization Staff

The Rural Appalachian: By-passed By The Federal Housing Program
by Pat Gah

Change: Yes!
Middle Class Values: No!
by David Whisnant

Chapter II

Chapter III

Astor Dobson

Photography Portfolio

Fig. 7
the difficulty in illustrating a given text with photography. Most of the incidents recorded in the article either did not lend themselves to a visual explanation or had occurred so long ago that securing photographs of the actual events was difficult even if possible. It was felt, however, that some visual relief from six pages of type was necessary. Since many readers glance through a magazine before reading it, photographs and illustrations, in addition to headlines in bold typeface, tend to first attract attention. Thus two photographs were selected from the Appalachian Photographic Archives to illustrate a sense of what the article is about. There is discussion of mining operations as early as the 1930s, and the portrait of the coal miner (Fig.8) that was used could date from that period. The directness of his gaze is arresting and helps to remind the reader of the human element involved in this discussion of the TVA. Therefore, the stress on the corporate nature of the TVA is contrasted with the individual miners who have mined the coal being discussed.

The photograph of the trains (Fig.9) helps make concrete the process of producing, buying and shipping tons of coal. So many large numbers mentioned in the article might anaesthetize the reader from their actual meaning. The photographs of the miner and the trains may help the reader to visualize how many tons one man can mine, how many tons it takes to fill a railroad car, and how many men must fill how many railroad cars to reach those figures of production discussed. And finally, the pictures provide a visual insight into how wide an influence the TVA's buying practices could have over the years. The photographs represent all coal miners and the process of producing coal, and thus become symbols.

A photograph used illustratively may take on a more general
The agency's known competence power a good deal, especially in the area of power production, and the agency's demonstrated effectiveness in the efficient use of power equipment and methods has been evident since its earliest days. The T.V.A.'s work in power, production, and distribution has been marked by a high degree of efficiency and economy in the use of resources.

The T.V.A. has not only contributed to the economic development of the area, but has also played a significant role in the social and cultural life of the region. The agency has been involved in a wide range of activities, from education and public health to recreation and tourism.

The T.V.A. has been a leader in the development of technological innovations, and has made significant contributions to the advancement of knowledge in fields such as environmental science and renewable energy.

The agency has also played a key role in the development of the region's infrastructure, including roads, bridges, and water supply systems.

Despite its many accomplishments, the T.V.A. has also faced challenges and controversies over the years. Its operations have been subject to criticism from those who believe that the agency has been too government-controlled and too focused on the needs of industry rather than the needs of the general public.

In recent years, the T.V.A. has undergone significant reforms, with a greater emphasis placed on customer service and the use of private sector management techniques.

The agency's future is likely to be marked by continued efforts to balance the needs of industry and the environment, and to ensure that its operations are transparent and accountable to the public.

The T.V.A. continues to be a key player in the region's economic development, and its contributions to the area's growth and prosperity are likely to be felt for many years to come.

Fig. 8

Fig. 9
meaning because of its juxtaposition to a certain text and its specific context may be enlarged or enhanced by its relationship to ideas expressed in the text. For instance, in the articles "A Felt Linkage" and "The Road Back" in *Mountain Review* (Vol. 3, No. 2) (Figs. 10, 11) photographs of people other than those discussed in the articles are successful, I think, as illustrations, because the photographs transcend their particularness and become symbols of something else.

Both "A Felt Linkage" and "The Road Back" were originally components of a projected book of essays about the Appalachian experience to be edited by Jim Wayne Miller, a professor at Western Kentucky University. "The Road Back," written by Betty Payne James, concerns itself with those university educated Appalachians who have tried to return permanently to the rural, isolated areas of the mountains. She writes about "the hillsides in valleys we have unwillingly left behind." As Ms. James explains, "our sense of belonging to that time-caught landscape draws us, in our separation from it, to some continual and certain knowledge of return."  

"A Felt Linkage" begins with several introductory paragraphs about high school graduates having to leave home in order to find jobs, and goes on to address the emotional changes in one's self image. Mr. Miller claims "we need this felt linkage (with past generations) which is true culture, for it tells us who we are."  

In the photograph illustrating the "Felt Linkage" article (Fig. 10), the Van Lear Senior Class remains a specific group of people—they are even named. But the nostalgia aroused by the photograph for our own Senior Class complements those nostalgic feelings evoked in the text for Appalachia and going home. In the same way, the photograph of mother and home used to illustrate "The Road Back" (Fig. 11) renders a sense of the
A Felt Linkage
by Jim Wayne Miller

To readers of a Kentucky novel recently expressed concern about the county's loss of skilled and educated young people, the need to re-examine the question. The author, a former resident of the county, who was also concerned to make a living, he claimed, is not the only one. People are not the only problem. The problem is the economy, the Butler, and the skilled workers for the first time among workers employed outside the county.

The novel's plot didn't go anywhere. A house in the story, which provided a sense of a world that didn't fit into a single reader, I was hoping that the high school explained a number of things about the people living in the county. Also, some of those who were in a college of the county, and who would do so, the city because opportunities for professionals and highly skilled workers were limited.

People have been driven away from the place of the New York City. The reason is the city itself, and the reason people have joined the Soviet Union because opportunities for professionals and highly skilled workers were limited.

Jim Wayne Miller, a native of Western North Carolina, is a poet, short story writer, and a professor at Warren Wilson College.

The Road Back
by Betty Payne James

You are those of us who belong to the mountains, there is always the home-going, sometimes, a sense of belonging to the childhood landscapes, a sense of belonging in the mountains. There are certain limitations, a sense of belonging.

Learning about the economy, the major of us, more often to work as clerks and towns along the perimeter of the Appalachian range. Yet we have come to know that, the crowded avenues of Athens, Knoxville, Washington, Caroga, growing into the urban environment of the hilly and wooded country, where we are losing, the weight of a mountain, a sense of belonging.

Betty Payne James graduated from Brown College in 1987. Upon completion of her graduate studies at the University of Kentucky, she was for a brief time, a professor of poultry science. She and her husband have just finished a collection of regional recipes which is titled THE Poultry Cookbook.

average jobs in this college has prepared an area part of an unexplained socio-political phenomenon, some like it here. Occasionally, because of the lack of understanding of the inherent nature of the problems, some are moving, they have moved, it a sense of belonging, some are moving, and the others are moving, in a sense of belonging.

We have come to know that, the crowded avenues of Athens, Knoxville, Washington, Caroga, growing into the urban environment of the hilly and wooded country, where we are losing, the weight of a mountain, a sense of belonging.

Betty Payne James graduated from Brown College in 1987. Upon completion of her graduate studies at the University of Kentucky, she was for a brief time, a professor of poultry science. She and her husband have just finished a collection of regional recipes which is titled THE Poultry Cookbook.

average jobs in this college has prepared an area part of an unexplained socio-political phenomenon, some like it here. Occasionally, because of the lack of understanding of the inherent nature of the problems, some are moving, they have moved, it a sense of belonging, some are moving, and the others are moving, in a sense of belonging.
universal quality of loss which, in turn, helps the audience empathize with the plight of the dispossessed Appalachians. By setting up our nostalgia for universal situations of loss and time passing the photographs take us into the particularness of the text and create in us a vulnerability to the situation of those dispossessed people.

Another example of an archival photograph used to illustrate a text is the photograph of the young boy in "The Life of James Claibourn Jones" (Vol.3, No.3) (Fig.12). Possibly no one knows who the young boy in the photograph is or was, but he isn't the actual James Claibourn Jones who speaks in the autobiography. Yet, we are willing to suspend disbelief and accept this boy as the youthful Jones as we would an actor playing the part.

The illustrative photograph may sometimes legitimately be inaccurate or inconsistent as long as it does not cause discord with the sense of the text. For example, in the article "Take My Sins Away" (Vol.1, No.4) (Figs.13-16) one will notice that the window is first dark (Fig.13) and then light (Fig.15). The reader/viewer may wonder, due to the sequence of the photographs, whether the service began in the evening and lasted till dawn or whether, as was actually the case, the service began in the early evening and lasted until 11:00 pm. Cutlines accompanying the photographs would have explained this and perhaps given a clearer insight into what was actually going on in the service; but I failed to notice the windows before going to press and, more important, I didn't feel that readers needed an explanation of what was going on in each photograph. Because there are no captions to provide easy connections between photographs and text, room is left for personal interpretation of the photographs. So the pictures become more than illustrations and require the same analysis as does the text.
The Life of James Claybourn Jones

By James Claybourn Jones

I was born in Floyd county, Kentucky, in the sand hills of a small town named South Bassett. My father, James Jones, was born and raised in Harlan County, Tennessee, coming to Floyd County when he was about twenty years old, leaving me a tenderfoot, or rather, a tenderfoot boy. I was born in your usual county, Virginia. My father's first wife was my paternal aunt, love to her andI Treo in a small patch of corn. My father's father's father was a tobacco farmer, and he raised corn. My father was about twenty years old when he was born, and he was raised by his parents. He and I were brothers and sisters.

One day a Kentucky buggy came to the door of our little house, and Mr. Jones, my father, said to me, "I will take you to see the new book in the store." We went to the store and bought a book called "The Life of James Claybourn Jones."
Take My Sins Away

Fig. 13

Fig. 14

Fig. 15

Fig. 16
An example of a photograph used as illustration that is inaccurate in relation to the text is the photograph of the cabin (Fig.17) accompanying the essay, "Come Home and Gone" (Vol.3, No.2). The illustration and the layout chosen are only one of a number of possibilities, but this photograph bears the closest resemblance to the cabin of the text than any other photograph of a cabin in the Appalachian Photographic Archives. The text refers to a front porch on the cabin. It's doubtful that the wooden awning and the front step of the threshold could be considered a porch, but I felt that the photograph adequately represented my own visual image of the cabin in all other respects; therefore, I decided to use it. But perhaps another editor would be bothered by the discrepancy.

Historical photographs from the Archives have also been used to illustrate fiction in Mountain Review, the first attempts being "The Election" and "The Day They Got the Duke" (Vol.2, No.4) (Figs.18-21). However, neither application results in a successful illustration of the stories involved. In "The Election" the photographs used as illustration have no relation to the action or setting of the story (which is concerned with a changing political scene as evidenced by new young candidates and the waning political influence of old timers), but rather depend on actual words (i.e. the sign on the train) to connect them with the text. The fact that the photographs are in some way connected with the elective process does not make them successful illustrations of a story about elections. In "The Duke" the two photographs (Figs.20-21), judging from dress, seem to be from distinctively different time periods. Frequently a photograph can, in fact, transcend its particularness. In this case, although an argument could be made that the two photographs reflect conflicting forces within the story (i.e. 
Come Home and Gone

by Curtis Seltzer

Leaves of home cool—the year of unyielded desires—appeared in a heap one day last winter near to the quarter-old, inside big cabin on our ridge. The day was cloudy, and a low autumn wind blew through the trees. A heavy wind, which has been so much in the coastal mountains. The man had come home to the place where he had been raised. Both showed many years from the place left up, even though he was still young when the coal appeared.

As the leaves of Appalachian were scattered, we would see the old man up and around as we drove by each morning. With his hat turned over, he sat spending many hours on the porch. He always spent the fall, spring, and summer months in the field. He was the kind of man who would not leave the house on a rainy day, even though the wind would not let him.

The Election

"Time don't set still... not even in the mountains..."

A story by E. Floyd Adams

A dark, deep water made its way up to the top of the cabin. The man who was sitting up there in the corner of the world where he had been raised, and several paths of the older man had been taken, was sitting on the steps of the cabin. He was the kind of man who would not leave the house on a rainy day, even though the wind would not let him.

The election in the mountains was held in the fall, spring, and summer months in the field. He was the kind of man who would not leave the house on a rainy day, even though the wind would not let him.

He had seen many of his life living around for walls and patrons for the house in the field. He had seen many of his life living around for walls and patrons for the house in the field. He had seen many of his life living around for walls and patrons for the house in the field. He had seen many of his life living around for walls and patrons for the house in the field.

"I'm not there. I'm not there..."

The man who was sitting up there in the corner of the world where he had been raised, and several paths of the older man had been taken, was sitting on the steps of the cabin. He was the kind of man who would not leave the house on a rainy day, even though the wind would not let him.
The Day They Got the Duke

A story by Robert Yerick

He was the best... and I don't mean just at making whiskey.

It was in January, 1970, just before Christmas. Duke and I were on our way back from a four-hour workshop. It was at a couple of small village schools a few miles from town. We were teaching some workshops for the children. Duke and I had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop. We were teaching the kids how to make the best whiskey in the world.

We knew the kids were good, but we had to show them how to make it right. We had to show them how to make it smooth and strong. We had to show them how to make it right.

Well, Duke was one of the best. He had a lot of friends, and he knew a lot of people. He was the best whiskey maker in the world. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop.

No one could make a better whiskey than Duke. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop.

Duke had the best whiskey in the world. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop.

Duke had taught us how to make the best whiskey in the world. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop.

Duke had taught us how to make the best whiskey in the world. He had been teaching workshops for years, before there was a workshop.
romanticism of the moonshiner versus the hard-edged pragmatism of the law), the fact that these two photographs seem to be derived from separate sources (perhaps a police file and a shoe box in someone's attic) and separate time periods creates a conflict in the reader's mind over whether to accept either photograph as realistic document or fanciful interpretation. This tends to destroy verisimilitude and thus limits the photograph's ability to transcend its particularness.

Archival photographs are used more successfully in illustrating "Summer's Child" (Vol.3, No.3) (Fig.22), in which the two young girls are close enough in age and appearance to represent the two fictitious girls in the story, and "Hog Eyes" (Vol.3, No.1) (Figs.23-24). In "Hog Eyes" the photographs illustrate several points in the story; for instance the hog's head in the wash tub (Fig.24) is mentioned on page 16 of the magazine. And although there possibly exists some discrepancy between the number of characters in the story--there are two men and a boy and three hogs, and no dogs involved in the action--and the number of characters in the photograph (Fig.23)--only two men, one hog, yet two dogs; and although a sled is involved in the story and the hog is apparently not dragged for any distance, while in the photograph there is no sled and the hog is apparently being dragged for some distance, I think this photograph successfully conveys that bleak atmosphere of the killing in "Hog Eyes." In fact the action of the photograph is ambiguous enough to fit any of several mental images evoked by the text.

If one agrees with Armstrong-Jones that one of the tasks of the photojournalist is to make people read the article, then it seems likely that among important considerations for the photography editor concerning photographs are their relationship to words, position on
Summer's Child
by Ann Ross

Granddaddy said it was one of the loveliest, brightest summers he could remember. He checked us on the farm every time he turned a page in the almanac, tracing the lines with his finger—tracing and remem...
Hog Eyes

A story by Lee Pennington

Fig.23

Hog Eyes

Fig.24

The Rugged Man of the Hills

The old hill man is a strange creature in the modern world today. Independence is no longer feasible. The individual is scarce today.

He is content with what he has. That calls for him to build his own future with his own hands. Obstacles to modern ways are constant.

The impending mountain range holds true. The Eagle Eyes quick to find any sign that every man should have the same risk they ought to think of. And the trade. The mountain man's land.

The rugged man of the hills would say.

"Out of the little rugged and cold, the dog still grows and comes true. Many tough and fastidious follow the lead. He will ram you with the snow."

By Marvin Gullett
the page and layout—things usually of no consequence to the photographer working for gallery exhibitions. Frederick Wiseman, the documentary filmmaker, discusses editing a film in terms that could also be applied to the spatial editing of a photojournalistic article. He explains how material initially thought useless can provide cutaways or pauses when placed between long scenes and give a rhythm or pace to the material. Similarly, still photographs can serve to vary the pace and break the monotony of the printed page, and an aesthetic arrangement of text and photographs tends to draw the reader into the written text. Faced with the task of fitting photographs and text into a limited space with an often predetermined format, one could almost become sympathetic to John Morris, former Times picture editor, when he advised Robert Frank, concerning Frank's photographing for Magnum, the picture agency, "You know, you should learn to take more vertical pictures, because we work for magazines." 

As an example of the organizational problems encountered in working with both text and pictures the photograph of the baby and the laying-on-of-hands ceremony in the "Take My Sins Away" article (Fig.16) was originally horizontal in format (Fig.25), but because of space limitation and column width the picture was cropped to a square format. No information necessary to the article has been lost. The minister is still visible, so that the continuity of his presence in all the photographs is maintained. The photograph could have been cropped so as to include the bottle of oil on the pulpit, which is used in the ceremony to anoint the child, but then the face and the raised hand of the woman on the left would have been lost. As it is that hand, catching the light as it does, forms the apex of a triangle with two others' hands and neatly surrounds the baby's head. Cropping thus keeps the
baby in the center of the photograph just as he is already the center of attention for the other people in the illustration. It could be argued that in this instance the photograph was strengthened by cropping from the original format. The photograph on the facing page of the same article (Fig.15) was also cropped from its horizontal format to fit the amount of available space, and together, both pictures relieve the visual monotony of two pages of type. In the same way the photographs on the two previous pages (Figs.13-14) add visual variety as do the words in bold typeface on the first two pages. These examples aren't offered as a comparison of the relative merits of the cropped photograph versus the standard 35mm photographic frame, but merely to accent some of the problems in making photographs for photojournalistic purposes and using them within strictly defined limits.

The photographs used in illustrating several "creative" pieces in Mountain Review were not executed in the traditional photojournalistic style. They were not used simply as illustration of text and placed in such a manner as to provide visual relief from pages of type, but were cropped and manipulated so as to interact with the type and white space to create an alternative, more decorative visual form from the usual interspersion of words and pictures. In "Spring Time in Eastern Kentucky Means Good Eats," (Vol.2,No.3) (Fig.26) the woman is perhaps easily recognizable to her friends, but the elimination of the background and, therefore, specific reference points, helps to "generalize" her so that she represents any of the women "you can see...all over the place picking planting greens and poke." In "Once Upon a Time" (Vol.2,No.2) (Fig.27) the placement of the text and title in the sky tends to lend this picture an air of unreality, which reinforces the imaginative
Of the farmers only made enough food for
the sum of the crops grown between years, overs, and
many other things. They do the former, and earn
them, without the cost on the side. They then hold the
strict control of all the food, so that any person
who is not a farmer, cannot even have a foot in the
market. This is a great evil, and one that should be
abandoned, for it is both unjust and impractical.

The time has come to discuss the idea of
moving the council to a new location. It is time to
accept the fact that the current location is not
sufficient for the needs of the council. The
move would not only provide more space, but
also ensure that the council members have a
place to meet where they can openly discuss
issues and make decisions. It is time to take the
step towards a better future for the council and
its members.

Spring, Time, and Eastern Kentucky Means
GOOD EATS

by Ralph Hall

Once Upon A Time...

by Elizabeth Ann Enders

Fig. 26

Fig. 27
force of the story. The fact that the horse has stopped and turned and is looking at the reader/viewer assures us that this is, in fact, the talking horse of the story. Without this confrontation, it would have been a picture of just another horse. The picture used in "The Hunt" (Vol.3, No.2) (Figs.28-30) is a photograph printed to such high contrast that it is unrecognizable as a specific woman and has become a rather abstract image of the hair and eyes of "woman." The repetition of this abstract image suggests women as "the game" of the hunt. A magazine may easily become cluttered, confusing and cute with too many decorative combinations of words and illustrations, but the occasional use of such a technique is, I think, effective in design and layout.

The photographs accompanying the article "Noah Kinney: Woodcarver" in Mountain Review (Vol.1, No.3) (Figs.2-3) were used in an attempt to add visual interest to a somewhat blandly written article. Thus the photographs on the second page (Fig.3) were included to illustrate the main points of the article in the space allowed: Mr. Kinney carving, Mr. Kinney's handiwork and Mr. Kinney playing music. Unfortunately some of the more interesting negatives of the Kinneys were damaged. Had they been useable the story probably would have been extended to several pages and the text made subordinate to the photographs. As it happens the text and the too dark, uninteresting photographs are actually in competition for a space too small to contain both. Yet the photograph of Noah Kinney on page one of the article (Figs.2, 31) also appears in my photographic exhibit, as it transcends its reportorial function and achieves an independence from the words of the article. Any of several other photographs of Kinney and his wife, Hazel (Figs.32-34), could have served as portraits. But there is a certain strength and dignity to this first photograph that is missing in the
The Hunt
by Connie Jean Cole

Remind me not to do that again

To my composer father who wouldn’t play drums, so my brother who couldn’t, to the violinist who punched me out while my head was in an ice machine (yes, it’s real), to the Hunter I Hallowed, and finally, if I’m that I, wish you pick and sore strings.

The hunt
or something about someone
playing their own instrument seduced me everyday.

Breach play that way in your hunting shack.
Screams’ roar of the fire crackles in rhythm
and bounding bowls in harriner-y, yeah boy,
yet jas shells’ streak as an arrow down the wachusettaki river in yore cannot.

Remind my who

He didn’t

I was

Your

You're

She's not

She's way

Talk to me.

Talk to me.

She wants to, but can’t apologize for needing more time.

She wants to, but can’t apologize for needing more time.

Excuse my disharmonies for the hunt.

Excuse my disharmonies for the hunt.

The Hunt
by Connie Jean Cole

Heritage

Amy E. Armstrong

May, 1977

Fig. 28

Fig. 29

Fig. 30
Fig. 31
other three, which are also illustrative of the article and convey information—what Noah Kinney and his wife look like—but are simple, static and straightforward "pictures of the people involved." The photograph used in the exhibit does not depend on any information contained in the article, but remains interesting and arresting when removed from the context of the article. There is a certain amount of mystery or ambiguity concerning the relationship of the two people and their relationship to the photographer. The stance of the man and the short subject to camera distance make him large in relation to the frame which, combined with his clasped arms and the way in which he almost defiantly stands before the photographer and in front of the woman, lends him an imposing stature, and yet her position almost undercuts this stature. The texture of the wood behind them is repeated in the lines of his face and suggests a connection of weathering and age. So, while four portraits of Noah Kinney could serve to illustrate the article, only one of these seemed appropriate for the photographic exhibit.

In addition to being static, the three portraits of the Kinneys (Figs. 32-34) suggest the stereotypical "hillbilly" often portrayed in the media, especially where the Kinneys pose with their handicrafts (Fig. 32) in front of a house with tar paper exterior and a car tire in the front yard (the casual observer might not notice that the tire was purposely placed to protect a young plant growing there). Concerned with the sources of some of our visual prejudices, the Harvard psychiatrist Robert Coles, at a symposia at Wellesley College, discussed a family who lived in a shack in Florida and whose lives he had been documenting. He had been recording only the misery and degradation of their lives, because he had been seeing only what he
wanted to see. Then one day he noticed the woman watering a plant:

Now there was a softness to that moment that came across in her body, and the light was there, and the plant was there to get the sun. It was so different from those same people standing in front of that cabin looking like the end of America. So it isn't just a matter of style, I think. It's a matter of different moments in the same lives and whether the particular person, be he a writer or a photographer, wants to respond to it.18

Coles goes on to say that a person will find in reality that which he or she is looking for and the situation becomes an extension of the artist's own purposes. In the same way, the portrait in the exhibit (Fig.31) is a different moment in the lives of the Kinneys that I chose to respond to and that best expresses my feelings about the couple.

Since Mountain Review was not purely journalistic and because my work as photography editor often included the role of art editor, it is difficult to consider my work on that magazine as simply an example of photojournalism. But it probably would be true to say that much of my work for Mountain Review reflects the fact that photography has various functions and that as the function of photography changes, so its relationship to words changes. Illustrative photography tends to place photography in a relationship in which it is dependent upon words, or where its primary function is to enhance the reader's understanding or interest in a text. Whether the photograph is a literal or abstract interpretation of a text, or portion of text, the photograph tends to be reliant upon words for its existence, and intrinsic artistic merit cannot always be the primary criterion for selection. Photographs may be used in different ways within the illustrative mode itself. A work may be a direct illustration, or documen-
tation of a text or section of text, or it may be a symbolic or
dramatic representation, or it operates in a less exact, more
evocative way. Too, an illustrative photograph may take on a physical
relationship with the text as an editor strives for visual effect.

While in Mountain Review the role of the photograph is essen-
tially to be supportive of a text, the photographs in a work such as
Time Was are, we shall see, essentially autonomous, though there
does seem to be a cumulative relationship in which photographs and
text support each other. The editor of such a work is less of an
illustrator than the photography editor of, say, Mountain Review, and
the relationship of words to text is much less physical (in the sense
of that interaction of photograph and words in "The Hunt" for
example). In both publications, though, photographs are most often
used as regional or historical documentation. My exhibition photo-
graphs are really not concerned with rendering a definite sense of
time or region. A photograph becomes, I think, more independent of
verbal assignment and is informed with a greater degree of ambiguity
as its meaning becomes more universal and its function becomes less-
illustrative. Editorial decisions for my exhibition photography
didn't involve the possible relationship of photograph to text, but
perhaps involved the way in which the work itself contains its own
rhythms of existence. The exhibition photograph of the Kinneys and
the type of photograph Coles calls for in his account of the woman
watering her plant tend to escape that predetermination of subject and
concept which characterizes most illustrative photography.
In 1976 the Knott County Bicentennial Committee and Alice Lloyd College published the photographic album, *Time Was: An Album for the Bicentennial* (Figs. 35-36). This was a continuation of a working association which had resulted the previous year in the successful production of a calendar of pictures from the Appalachian Photographic Archives. My purpose in editing and designing this publication was to create a collage of photographs and text to suggest a feeling for the way life was in the mountains—at least the way it was remembered by the resident historians interviewed. The selections were not intended to give a factual history of a particular time, but to create a view of the way "time was," by using photographs to trigger memories in grandchildren of grandparents' recollections of the way things were for them. Both the photographs and the excerpts from the oral history tape recorded interviews are in a sense "found" objects that have been correlated and put together in a collage to evoke a particular feeling.

A budget of approximately $5,000 dictated to some extent considerations such as size, format, type of printing, paper stock and
number of copies printed. I decided that the photographs would be printed as duotones on good paper stock and then determined the number of copies and page numbers that would provide a unit price of one dollar. I selected a horizontal format which allowed for greater enlargement of the predominantly horizontal photographs than would a vertical format.

Apart from trying to maintain a majority of the photographs from Knott County, I had relative freedom in editing the selection of 45 photographs and 41 excerpts of oral history interviews. The photographs and text of *Time Was*, together suggest the evolving history of the region. My first concern was to render a sense of relationships within the family as well as to show the relationship of people to the land and to their homes. The early settlers were relatively self sufficient: they hunted and trapped for meat, grew vegetables, wove cloth, built their houses and made their own furniture and farming tools. As they discovered the natural resources of the area they logged the forests and mined the coal. People traded goods and services and became storekeepers. More mobility resulted in greater communication—the mail, phones, the Express Company. Kids went to one room schools and played games. Circuit judges came around as did circuit preachers. The first railroad was built, the first automobile arrived, the first airplane, and nothing is the way it was. Those changes which took place within the segment of history documented in *Time Was* perhaps suggest the vaster changes which took place in the world both before and after that period and therefore cause us to reflect on the history and future of human existence.

Initially, I edited a number of photographs from the 2500 photographs in the Archives—trying to select pictures that were visually interesting and at the same time illustrative of different facets of
the area's history, while the text was taken from the 350 interviews that were already transcribed. A text merely descriptive of the pictures could easily be dull, so I read the transcripts for quotes that I liked or found funny or that talked about certain segments of history I wanted to include and then I would try to mentally juxtapose those excerpts with photographs I remembered from the Archives. Likewise when I discovered a photograph I wanted to use, I would scan the transcripts to find a quote or quotes that somehow related to that photograph. I tried to maintain two modes of expression, photography and language, as autonomous but complementary forms to develop a feeling for the history of the mountains.

An example of this editing process is the section of eight pages of pictures and text in *Time Was* concerning schools and children at play in which is included a photograph of the Hindman High School girls' basketball team (Fig. 38). I decided to include a sports picture here because of the theme of this section, but the photograph I first selected was one of the Hazard High School girls' basketball team (Fig. 39). The repetition of the girls' dark V-neck jerseys and the horizontal lines formed by their knees created patterns which, together with a symmetrical background, created a photograph more formal in arrangement than that of the Hindman team (Fig. 40). However, the substitution was made at the suggestion of the Knott County Bicentennial Committee (Hindman is the county seat of that county) which was partially funding publication of the book. In an effort to remove several distracting elements, such as the staircase and tree in the background and a too wide expanse of grass in the foreground, I decided to omit the background entirely and draw a circular frame, not only to repeat the shape of the basketball, but to vary somewhat the format of the
This album is the result of the continuing association between the Knott County Bicentennial Committee, Inc. — a non-profit, community governed organization which has been active since 1971 in preparing for the two-hundredth anniversary of the American Revolution — and the Appalachian Learning Laboratory of Alice Lloyd College, a private, co-educational, two-year college located in the mountains of Knott County, Kentucky.

The Bicentennial Committee — whose Board of Directors is representative of the total community — was incorporated in 1974 and has been designated by the government of the county to plan for and direct Knott County's Bicentennial activities. Knott County was the first county in Eastern Kentucky to be named a Bicentennial Community and was featured as a "Model for Rural America" in the USA 200 Newsletter of March, 1975. A small grant was awarded, through the State Bicentennial Office, for an internship program in which high school and college students research the history of their own community by interviewing older residents on tape. A Knott County project — the East Kentucky Health Services Center — was one of three projects in the United States to be featured in a national film on the Bicentennial celebration, and the Bicentennial Committee is initiating the building of a multi-purpose Human Services Center for Knott County.

Alice Lloyd College has developed the Appalachian Learning Laboratory to serve as a regional resource center for mountain life and culture. The pictures in this album are taken from the college's Appalachian Photographic Archives. The text is made up of conservation fragments from the Appalachian Oral History Project. Other components of the Appalachian Learning Laboratory are the quarterly magazine, Appalachian Heritage; and the Appalachian Summer Theatre. The Appalachian Learning Laboratory coordinates the Appalachian Term, which offers courses to students and organizations from both inside and outside the mountains, who wish to take advantage of Alice Lloyd's unique location and programs as they examine Appalachian culture.

The photographs of this album bear no formal relationship to the text which accompanies them. Both, however, offer aspects of mountain existence when, as one resident historian suggests, "...people lived with the land." The Bicentennial affords us all an opportunity to look beyond our everyday existence to the principles upon which the nation was founded. Perhaps such documents, recollections, as this will help us keep in mind the dignity of the past as we create our future.

Fig. 37

Fig. 38
photographs in the book, the majority of which are rectangular. In view of my earlier dissatisfaction with this photograph, it is interesting to look at the review of *Time Was* in the September, 1976 issue of *Popular Photography* in which Natalie Canavor tells us the image I liked best showed the 1929 Hindman High School girls basketball team. Eight young women look directly at the camera, carefully posed but with a few expressions hinting that a moment of merriment had just been interrupted. Crossing all boundaries of time and lifestyle, I experienced that spark of recognition we each feel for certain images...2

as a reflection of the proposition that "editing will differ according to the editor."

Any of several funeral portraits could have been selected for inclusion in *Time Was* in the section on death and funeral customs, and the one I first considered was the corpse of a young boy being supported by someone sitting under a sheet (Fig.41). However, this section was intended to convey a sense of family ties and closeness between family members and neighbors. I felt that the photograph of the boy, although interesting, was too unusual and detracted from the purpose of the text (Fig.42), while the funeral portrait of Clell Back (Fig.43) illustrated the closeness of a family in death.

With text edited from taped interviews and photographs edited from a photographic archives, *Time Was* combines text and photographs slightly differently from *Mountain Review*. The photographs are not simply illustrative of the text, but reach for what John Szarkowski claims is that ideal relationship of words and text where both have a "kind of real collaborative, separate but equal, independent status...."3 The photographs are not relegated to the function of
Well, we didn't have any undertaker back then in this country and when people died, they'd dress them themselves. They'd make their clothes and they'd dress them. They'd make their caskets and they'd put them away. Dig their graves and put them away.

Well, whenever they would die and I dressed a person, they set a sauce of salt on their stomach, like that to keep them from swelling and they'd set a cloth in camphor and put it over their face for it to keep them from changing. They wouldn't keep a person up over two days. Yeah, they made the caskets out of plank and then they lined it with black saw.
illustrations, nor are the words relegated to the function of captions, but a mutual collaboration takes place. It was suggested in a review of Time Was by Guy Mendes that "the words are not 'about' the pictures, nor do the pictures merely illustrate the words. But they are both 'of' a time long gone."  

Part of my concern in editing Time Was was to avoid setting up false relationships between text and photographs. Of course, adjacent speeches and photographs dealt with the same topics, but I felt that it would be misleading to invite a connection between a particular face and a particular statement on the opposite page. So several individual portraits were not used because I did not want these people to be taken for the resident historians whose statements were adjacent. Sontag claims that Bob Adelman's Down Home is a successful and honest collaboration because the photographed subjects also talk by means of transcribed interviews, but that Michael Lesy's Wisconsin Death Trip, though a "rousing polemic," is "specious as history," because pictures and words from different sources are forced together out of context. Sontag's undermining of Lesy is opposed by Nathan Lyons, who, in Afterimage, sees Lesy's book as a "healthy infusion (of emotional issues) back into history." And even Sontag, at times, has been able to consider less than complete objectivity as a valid approach to history. For example, disappointed because of the apparently simple-minded way the Vietnamese have of recounting history, she reminds herself, in "A Trip to Hanoi"

that historical understanding can have other purposes than the ones I take for granted; objectivity and completeness. This is history for use—for survival, to be precise—and it is an entirely felt history, not the preserve of detached intellectual concern.

No claim is made for Time Was as an objective presentation of history.
It's a kind of neighborhood family album, for the people of the mountains know who many of the people in the photographs were, or are, and to whom they're related. They associate the photographs and text with their cultural heritage. In this role the photographs don't lose their "straight" reading (the original context within which the photographs were taken) as Sontag claims all photographs do in time, but retain their original function (mostly portraits and documents).
III
Exhibition

Susan Sontag's denigration of the photographic enterprise in the series of essays that first appeared in *The New York Review of Books* was modified somewhat when the essays were reissued in book form. In the book, *On Photography*, five pages, in which some important concessions to photography are made, are added to a review of John Szarkowski's *Looking at Photographs*. In that five page addition Sontag recognizes that "the very question of whether photography is an art or not is essentially a misleading one." For photography, like language, "is a medium in which works of art (among other things) are made."¹

But perhaps further distinction needs to be made about the ways in which photographs may operate as art. Even so called "fine art" photographs may be in essence illustrative when edited or selected according to already established verbal requirements. For instance, Minor White used photographs in an illustrative way as aspects of a preconceived concept when in the sixties and early seventies he edited the photographic exhibits "Light⁷," "Being Without Clothes" and "Octave of Prayer." He took photographs out of the context of the individual photographers' works and put them into what presumably was
or became his own context. White's exhibits, which were "selected to a theme in my head--so far as I could--with the photographs kindly submitted to me for editing."\(^2\) became essentially his own art work using others' photographs as his raw material.\(^3\) And a similar tendency to have photographs conform to a predetermined theme may be noticed in many photographic exhibits which appear to be illustrative of a particular theme selected by the photographer and indicated by the title. For whether such titles occur to the artist before or after the selection of photographs, each necessarily is placed in some fealty to the verbal denominator.

My thesis exhibition photographs do not adhere to an articulated thematic concern. Rather my concern is with the photographer's editorial process. For photography, from the initial decision to bring along a camera to the decision as to what to include in an exhibition or book is a constant process of selection or editing. There would be no way to show the viewer all the people, places and events which make up the photographer's experience and yet were not recorded on film. Thus, an examination of contact sheets would be the first visible evidence of the photographer's editorial process. Going one step further, I decided to include in my thesis a larger body of work, 60 photographs, (See Appendix) \(\sim\) from which the 35 final exhibition prints were selected, so that I could attempt to articulate reasons why one photograph is successful or preferred over another. (This is undertaken in the spirit of Arnold Newman who, in \textit{One Mind's Eye}, decided to show a few contact prints to answer questions about the way he made certain photographs, since only the finished product is usually shown in photography books. And in his classes he shows those photographs which he does not consider
successful as well as those which he considers publishable or fit for exhibition.  

The editor or the photographer/editor can arouse varying responses in the viewer by selecting certain photographs from a larger group. For example, an exhibit consisting of five photographs from my thesis (Figs. 44-48) with perhaps 25 additional photographs and entitled "Motherhood" would leave the viewer no alternative save the interpretation of these prints as somehow illustrative of aspects of motherhood. The substitution of, say, the title, "The Innocents" might change the focus of attention and precondition the viewer's response in another direction. My response to photographs at exhibitions with titles such as "Recensions, Retellings and Other Photographs," "Sunset After Dark and Other Work," and "Men Friends Undressed" (received notices of exhibitions) would certainly be influenced by these titles. And should a photograph seem not illustrative of the concept, I could be more concerned with why it seemed not to "fit" with the others than with relating to it on its own merits. Though some viewers may recognize that individual photographs are not appropriate to a title, the result may be aesthetic discord arising either from the artist's undermining of individual successes by their transference to a vulnerable group status, or from the artist's inability to understand how or why certain photographs operate together. To discuss expressive photography (personal statement) in relation to an overall articulated theme may afford some understanding of the way in which a photographer tends to take pictures, but relying upon a group of photographs to advance the possibilities of a particular photograph may also tend to deny the unique life of the individual work. 

The problem of subjugation of the individual photograph to its
Group function may seem a minor aspect in the total photographic endeavor, but for the artist in a competitive market it remains an unavoidable issue. Kathleen McCarthy Gauss, in the March, 1978 issue of *Afterimage*, claims that her statement to Dale Hueppchen, that the National Endowment for the Arts photographic fellowships selection panel's criteria for awarding grants was "commitment to some consistent expression of technique," had been taken out of context. Yet within the same paragraph she suggests that "a portfolio of several different types of work may seem to suggest some amount of uncertainty on the part of the photographer about his own work and the direction it is going"—as if to suggest that uncertainty is a crime in artistic sensibility. And, again in the same paragraph, Ms. Gauss suggests that the applicant's portfolio should show "a commitment or interest in some particular expression, technique, or problem." It is a suggestion which demands that the individual photograph be identifiable with a group concept, a common denominator. And if we choose to be concerned about the status of photography as art of the highest order (that is of the same status, with the same potential for achievement, as painting or poetry) that suggestion makes photography a shaky candidate. For though, in making overall judgements about the canon of, say, a painter, we may want to assess the cumulative quality of all, many or several of that painter's works, and though we may detect styles or themes running throughout his or her paintings, we may still demand that art of the highest intensity must first be realized by the achievement found in a particular (or individual) work.

In her denigration of photography as art of the highest order, Sontag intimates that the photograph is realized at the moment the shutter is released, a different operation, she claims, from painting
which is a construct, realized in time. What she doesn't allow for, however, is the complete photographic process, that is, the development, proofing, initial editing, work printing, final editing and final printing. The "lucky accident" she mentions may more frequently occur in photography, but this doesn't preclude the same accident occurring in other art forms. It remains for the artist to decide whether to make use of or discard the accident. For example, in Fig.48, it would be untrue to insist that the flowers in the right hand side of the frame were placed there to offset the activity at the left side of the frame, or that the boy at the left edge was purposely interrupted by the photographer in the middle of what appears to be a scream. Something about the young girl and the interactions within this family moved me to press the shutter release button. But it wasn't until I had made a contact sheet that it could be examined--accidents and intentions noted--and a decision made whether to make a print. Garry Winogrand claims to base his decision on what to print on what looks interesting on his contact sheets:

I look at the contacts; hopefully, if all is going well, looking at the contacts is a similar kind of adventure as shooting is. I photograph in terms of what looks interesting....When I look at pictures, when I look at the contacts, then I have to ask, is the photograph interesting?

It is at this point, as much as the initial decision to record a particular occurrence, that the subject matter and the formal elements of the work must come together to express an idea or construct. So we may assume that the intense process of editing itself--as the photographer selects from possible subjects, through examinations of contact sheets and decisions of what to print and how to print it--requires
a good deal more thought and labor than the instantaneous production which Sontag ascribes to photography.

These 35 exhibition photographs may be examined as a group and/or individually. So the question is, with no theme or article to illustrate, what is the basis for selecting 35 photographs from a body of work for exhibit? What makes one prefer one photograph over another? The narrator in Thomas Mann's Death in Venice states that critical praise is merely an outgrowth of inexplicable sympathetic feelings towards a work: "Men do not know why they award fame to one work of art rather than another. Without being in the faintest connoisseurs, they think to justify the warmth of their commendations by discovering in it a hundred virtues, whereas the real ground of their applause is inexplicable, it is sympathy." And, indeed, response to a work may vary in time as the spectator's own experiences change.

A good deal of my photographs were taken because I was drawn to certain people and sights and felt that I wanted to recognize them in some way. It has been sometimes an attraction to a physical beauty and sometimes a wonder at the seemingly constant flux of the stream of humanity as people interact with themselves and with me as they pass by. Riding the commuter train from New Jersey to New York for several years, I was fascinated to view scenes, from such a privileged position, of peoples' lives enacted in the backyard--barbecuing, hanging up wash, playing, etc.--all simultaneously living their lives unaware of the people in other backyards and of me. And yet from my perspective on the fast moving train, which generated in me a sense of transience, they all seemed somehow united in their vulnerability to the process of existence. I feel that the photographs I've edited for this exhibition tend to suggest that same sense of transience and an
empathy for the human condition.

In exploring the sensibilities of the artist and those often inexplicable feelings of empathy for certain people, Mann suggests that "sights and impressions which others brush aside with a glance, a light comment, a smile, occupy him more than their due; they sink silently in, they take on meaning."\(^\text{11}\) For example, early in *Death in Venice*, Aschenbach, the exemplar artist, a famed novelist who is the central character, is standing outdoors occupied in thought and he is "brought back to reality by the sight of a man standing in the portico, above the two apocalyptic beasts that guarded the staircase, and something not quite usual in this man's appearance gave his thoughts a fresh turn."\(^\text{12}\) Aschenbach had quite forgotten the man almost immediately, "yet whether the pilgrim air the stranger wore kindled his fantasy or whether some other physical or psychical influence came into play, he could not tell; but he felt the most surprising consciousness of a widening of inward barriers."\(^\text{13}\)

I don't wish to suggest that my photographs necessarily exert any influence upon the viewer. But rather that the photographs, which were made in response to an often inexplicable, perhaps intuitive, response to a scene similar to Aschenbach's or a feeling of empathy for a person, reflect in some way the complex reality of which we are a part. So I have tried to bring to the viewer the stranger with the "pilgrim air" and presented him as I found him in such a way that "whether he had come out of the hall through the bronze doors or mounted unnoticed from outside, it was impossible to tell."\(^\text{14}\) And now, having presented him, I'm inviting viewers to pay attention to and to think through their own relationship with what they're seeing. The suggestion is, of course, that these seemingly casual encounters have
real meaning and that reality is a stringing together of apparently unrelated encounters.

In my "expressive" as opposed to "illustrative" photography, I seem to have developed a style in which those photographs I find successful are always printed full frame. I don't propose that all photographers should print in this manner, or that prints selectively cropped are not successful. But for me, what seems to become a successful photograph makes good use of and incorporates into its form the entire 35mm frame. To state why I don't crop photographs might be to explain away something which has no rational basis. But to abide by the limitation of the camera's format makes, for me, a purer activity. within the confines of a relatively mechanical art, than it would be if I allowed myself to crop. Too, the knowledge that I will not crop what I photograph makes for more concentration as I search for subject matter. The portability of the 35mm camera allows me to consider subjects which reflect the continuity, contingency, flux of existence. To crop, I think, would betray my concern for the flow of things. My better photographs, I think, tend to undercut the boundaries of the frame. Characters, figures seem to be moving on and off of the photograph in defiance of, or oblivion to, the strictures of any boundaries imposed on them, so that the implication of what is outside of the frame has as much import as that which may be immediately observed.

Framing a black and white photograph necessarily eliminates a large segment of the almost 180 degrees the photographer was able to see at the time, as well as the sounds, smells, color, etc. of the original scene. The central problem of the photographer as defined by John Szarkowski is a simple one: "What shall he include, what shall
he reject?...The photographer edits the meanings and patterns of the world through an imaginary frame. This frame is the beginning of his picture's geometry."15 While the situation somewhat dictated the way in which the photographs of the article "Take My Sins Away" (Fig.16) were taken (in the rapidity of events, space in which action took place, etc.) so that controlled framing was difficult, technical and temporal demands for a photograph of Walden Pond (Figs.49-50) were relatively slight, and I suspect, though perhaps I didn't realize it at the time, that I was making decisions about what to include or not include in the frame. Where cropping was necessary (for spatial restrictions, column width, etc.) in the "Take My Sins Away" photographs, it was not necessary by reason of any external restrictions in the Walden Pond photograph, which was one of the first photographs I took and for which the original cropping (Fig.50) was an attempt to make forced connections between figures. Since I'd only started printing my own negatives, cropping was a novelty for me.

Although cropping did not significantly change the photographs in "Take My Sins Away" (Fig.16), it can significantly change the meaning of a photograph such as the one of Walden Pond. Full frame (Fig.49) there exists a certain amount of ambiguity concerning the reclining woman's relationship to the rest of the people. As it was originally cropped, vertically (Fig.50), the woman became part of the family group, but, printed full frame any decision as to relationship is left to the viewer.

This uncropped Walden Pond scenario is reflective of the mood of the rest of my photographs in the exhibition. My pictures are often ambiguous, as they have not been framed in a manner to force any connections or to telegraph relationships between people or objects
to the viewer. Novelist Iris Murdoch finds unsuccessful those novels in which characters are subject to the will or control of the author and successfully human those in which the characters are allowed to act as they can for themselves.16 A like comparison to the controlled character could be made with the photograph in which the photographer has chosen to set up an unmistakeable relationship or connection. I am not trying to set up unmistakeable juxtapositions of objects but am permitting a certain amount of ambiguity to exist in the photographs, to allow differing responses depending on one's particular values and experiences.

 Those photographs which permit only limited response seem the weakest photographs. While the circumstances of six photographs excluded from the exhibition (Figs. 51-56) are not any different from those of the included photographs—that is, people are moving around, interacting with some, oblivious to others—the tone is quite different. The humor of the situation seems too pointed and obvious and to overpower other elements of the photographs. The people are not presented sympathetically. For instance, in Fig. 51, the three identical trouser legs of the ushers protruding from the left hand corner suggest the ritual of the wedding processional and ceremony as orchestrated by mothers of the bride and culminating in the placing of the ring on the bride's finger. The bride is anonymous in the photograph and our attention is directed to the flexing of her newly ringed finger. The photograph suggests to me a cycle wherein the flower girl will replace in a few years the headless bride concerned only with her ring. The bewilderment of the flower girl is perhaps acceptable, but somehow the abrupt pointing finger of the groom and his directive to her overpowers the photograph. The same is true in Figs. 53 and 54; although there
are other factors present in the photographs, they depend too much on the facial expressions of two people—the woman in Fig. 53 and the young boy in Fig. 54. There appears to be no alternative for the viewer and he or she is deprived of what Richard Zakia, in *Perception and Photography*, terms the "creative act of participation."17

I'd like to think that my own photographs, most of which have commonplace subject matter, achieve what Arnheim suggests is the "awareness of the symbolic meaning expressed in a concrete happening, the sensing of the universal in the particular" which "gives significance and dignity to all daily pursuits...."18 What I think are my most successful photographs have a sense of movement about them. It is as if a light were turned on for a brief instant as these people move through the patterns of their lives, interacting with each other and being aware of each other. The rectangular frame becomes their stage and they perform on it as easily as they move on and off of it.

Sontag's introduction to Peter Hujar's *Portraits in Life and Death* discusses the static nature of all photography in terms of the juxtaposition of still and moving pictures in Siodmak's movie, *Menschen am Sonntag* (1928):

The intrusion...is like the intrusion of death. One minute we see ordinary folk milling, laughing, grimacing, yearning. The next moment—as, one by one, they step before the street photographer's black box—we see them frozen, embalmed in a "still." The photographs shock in the flow of the movie.19

Sontag is proposing that photographs are static, cannot exist in time, cannot suggest the flow of things. But the still photographs in Siodmak's movie, like those in other movies before and since, are no longer photographs in their own right, but are now part of the
technique of another work. The photographs are assigned a particular function, just as the camera on tripod with black cloth snapping in the breeze is assigned a particular symbolic function in Mann's *Death in Venice*. But these instances are not necessarily symbolic of all photography.

For Sontag, photographs are not able to create a continuum of thought because they do not exist in time and are dissociated. But Max Kozloff sees photography as possessing much greater powers than Sontag allows, and, in fact, recognizes a quite different use of the still shot in a movie. For him the still in Francois Truffaut's *Jules and Jim*, rather than suggesting death, offers a supercharged reality:

...the effect is very much like Lartigue's action photos: the poignant displacement of mobility by immobility lends to the most candidly caught sensations a maximum tension, a breathless permanence. It is the decisive turning point in the sensibility of photography.

Sontag claims that photography is "intimately connected with discontinuous ways of seeing," where the real is transfigured, distorted, where the part claims to be the whole and that there is no movement possible in photography because it disconnects that which is photographed from the flow of things and freezes the moment. But for Arnheim, who, unlike Sontag, recognizes the dynamic possibilities of the still photograph, photography's inability to render conventional notion of movement is surmounted by "tension," which, "inherent in any percept as size, shape, location, or color" can "have magnitude and direction" determined by "the weight of neighboring elements" and by "the shape of objects...along the axes of their structural skeletons."
He uses the term "movement" or "motion" to describe visual dynamics which he defines as directed tension derived spontaneously during perception from the given configuration of the pattern. Concerned with direction and, therefore, time, Arnheim sees work without directed tension or movement as dead.25

To Arnheim, the artist is aware not only of objects, but of the dynamic nature of spaces between those objects. Thus, while in Rorschach tests a concentration on interstices between figures may normally be interpreted as indicative of stubbornness and paranoia, the artist, trained to perform perceptual reversals, understands that spaces separating figures must be as carefully defined, understood, as figures themselves, that both figures and the spaces separating them make for configuration.26 For Arnheim, whenever more than one entity is present in a picture some kind of relationship is set up, depending on complementary and differing aspects of those beings. The shape of objects and the intervals between them is dynamic and the empty space between objects "is compressed by the objects and compresses them in turn."27

An example of the dynamic nature of intervals between objects is offered in the photograph of people walking along a city street with a tree in the foreground (Fig.57) in which the plastic area (a kind of triangle) defined by the boy, the tree and the group of three people on the right is as important as the people and objects in the photograph. For me, there is a certain elasticity suggested by the shape when it is first defined by the three elements mentioned and its interplay with the area defined by four elements created by the inclusion of the woman with the white pocketbook. My perception of the photograph is a "back and forth" motion of these two shapes or masses.
of air. Any attempts to group elements by similarity or proximity, etc. aren't successful. The photograph suggests a randomness because there's no easy connection to be made between its elements and it offers few clues towards interpretation. A tree is unexpectedly the only striking permanent fixture in the photograph. It is also the only thing in focus and treated three dimensionally with the modeling effect of dappled light and the knot hole.

In addition to tensions between people and objects within my thesis photographs, certain tensions exist because of the positioning of some elements in relation to the very frame itself. Action is suggested not only within the frame, but also outside the frame. For example, in Fig.58 the little girl leans over for a moment, temporarily stepping out of our field of vision. The people in Figs.57, 59,60 and 61 appear to be imminently striding out of the frame and the young boy in Fig.62 is trying his best to control the dog, but it appears that he is shortly to be pulled inside the doorway and out of our sight just as the man on the right is already half out of sight.

Though Sontag claims that "in photography the subject matter always pushes through,"28 it seem that, first the way in which we perceive a photograph, or the elements in a photograph, will dictate to some extent whatever interpretation one chooses. As Zakia suggests:

What you experience when you look at a photograph is quite different from what you would experience were you to look at each item in the photograph separately.29

A person sees by making comparisons, and Gestalt laws of perceptual organization as discussed by Arnheim and Zakia tell us that visual elements that are similar in shape, size and color tend to be seen
as related as do those elements in close proximity. In Fig.61, for example, the way in which we first perceive configurations of elements in the photograph may tend to induce any later interpretation chosen. Therefore the similarity in shape, size and tone of the two heads and the similar shape and tonality of the two figures' left arms perhaps tends to cause one to perceive these elements as connected or related. The two arms, seeming almost to touch at the elbow, form the shape of an "X," whereas the young man's arms alone are seen to form an "O," according to the Gestalt principle that "visual elements that require the fewest number of interruptions will be grouped to form continuous straight or curved lines."30

The man and woman in the photograph possibly don't know each other. Yet there is a certain poignancy in the way they seem to be turning away from one another, passing by. The viewer, I think, seeks to explain or interpret the photograph in terms of a projected relationship between the two people—not only because the photographer has chosen to include two people within the frame, but because of the way we first perceive certain elements in the photograph. And it's perhaps the "passing by" quality, working against the compatibility of their configurations, their forms, which attracts me to the photograph. In fact, the two likely strangers become related within the frame of the photograph.

When one looks at the photograph of people along the river bank (Fig.63) there is a tendency to connect or seek a relationship among the three women not grouped with the other people. The eye tends to travel from the slightly bent leg of the woman in the foreground to the similarly bent leg of the woman in the midground. Even though the third woman is seated rather than standing, her left leg is also bent and
completes a pattern formed by repetition. To continue this relationship between the three women, a straight line drawn between the two heads that are visible would connect with the head of the woman in the foreground, not shown in the photograph. Thus the position of elements within the photograph actually calls our attention (by following the projected line) to something that exists outside the frame. A certain amount of mystery exists in the mind of the viewer surrounding the woman leaning against the pole, as it isn't obvious what she's doing or what her relationship to the other people, or to what they seem to be watching, is. The photograph perhaps creates a certain state of mind.

In the same way that a photograph can produce a special state of mind by means of images, a poem can produce the poetic state of mind by means of words. Paul Valéry, 19th century French symbolist poet held that

\[
\text{a poet's function...is not to experience the poetic state; that is a private affair. His function is to create it in others.}^{31}
\]

Twenty-five of the 60 photographs were excluded from the exhibit because they are not successful in recreating that "poetic" or special state of mind. The photograph of the cabins on the beach (Fig. 64) is a case in point, as it does not evoke the sense of desolation that I perceived or experienced there. The cabins were standing on miles of isolated sand dunes and were oddly reminiscent of some early human's construct, situated in a circular pattern. They were obviously the product of thinking beings, but were overshadowed by the miles of natural sand dunes. The silence was interrupted by the almost non-sounds of the wind and the waves, and I remembered the old schoolroom
question concerning the presence or absence of sound when a tree falls in the forest and no one is there to hear it. One of the problems with the photograph of the cabins is that no one area is clearly defined as figure. Were more of the cabins visible (a wider lens could have been used or perhaps the subject to camera distance been increased) it is possible that the proximity and similarity of the visual elements (cabins) would facilitate the perception of a circle and establish a visual equilibrium—a closure. A Gestalt principle states that "nearly complete familial lines and shapes are more readily seen as complete (closed) than incomplete." Part of the attraction of the cabins for me was the fact that they were arranged in a circle (figure) upon miles of dunes (ground). This is not evident in the photograph, however, and the line formed by the cabins only dissects the "ground" of sky and sand into two almost equal parts.

Those photographs that seem too obvious were excluded early in the photographic process, which, as stated earlier, includes development, proofing, initial editing, work printing, final editing and final printing. Of two photographs taken of Klansmen, one (Fig. 65) was not included in the large group of 60 photographs, whereas the other (Fig. 66) is part of the exhibition. Perhaps the innocence which one may associate with the small boy provides too easy an opposition to the feelings one may have about the Klan. In this context the juxtaposition of the Klan with the boy on the bicycle seems too obvious to me, whereas I would probably find the same visual tension between figures successful with another subject. For me the formal, almost static quality of Fig. 66 is undercut by the slightly absurd small robed figures picking their way across the field.
The 35 prints of my exhibition were selected neither to illustrate a verbal theme, nor sequenced to "channel the way in which a series of pictures is seen for the sake of the meaning that comes out in that order" as Minor White defined sequencing. My concern was, as much as possible, to not violate the autonomy of the things I photographed by their conversion into a symbol of some aspect of my own sensibility. Nor was I attempting to suggest that the photographs are equivalent to something else. White's theory of equivalence tends to direct attention away from the photograph itself by inviting the viewer not merely to speculate on the meaning of the photograph, but even to replace the photograph with a self-created construct. For White, the photograph of a cloud may be a metaphor for a specific woman,

...namely her feminity. The photograph exhibits softness, delicacy, roundness, fluffiness and so corresponds to at least one feeling of emotion that he (the photographer) has about her.

But possibly both objects, cloud and woman, will be diminished in this transaction.

An alternative to illustration, sequencing and equivalence is photography which is akin to that branch of modern Imagist poetry which Louis Zukofsky, American poet and critic, termed "Objectivism." For the poet William Carlos Williams, Objectivism differed from Imagism in that it "concerned itself with an image more particularized, yet broadened in its significance. The mind rather than the unsupported eye entered the picture." And to Zukofsky's follower, Robert Creeley, though connections are always made between objects encountered within particular moments of experience, the important
thing is "how do you state something so that it occurs in its autonomy rather than your assumptions of that autonomy." For example, Creeley's poem "After Zukofsky"

Getting thoughtful
getting older--
looking out
the window
see the trees
still there

at once refuses to transform, yet goes beyond the recording of sensory experience, and while necessarily shaping a poem, allows things to exist as they are sensed.

While Sontag finds photography paralleling Imagist poetry in the way

both imply discontinuity, fragmentation, wrenching things from their context (to see them in a "fresh way"), then reassembling them arbitrarily, by collage

I feel that much photography tends more to reflect Objectivism rather than Sontag's interpretation of Imagism. My photographs, I think, tend to allow things to exist as they are sensed, yet I pay attention to those situations which reflect my own sensibilities rather than focusing on the raison d'être of the events themselves. I am interested in random occurrences within the event rather than the occurrences which conform to the ritual of the event. I am not particularly interested in communicating visual information about a place or even about a specific people. My formal interest is in the random way in which people organize themselves in relation to the frame. If I have thematic concerns, they are with the complex and tenuous con-
nections between all human beings. So although photographs in my exhibit were taken in such dissimilar places as Spruce Pine, Kentucky and New York City, their location isn't immediately obvious, as I haven't focused on the differences found in certain regions. The photographs don't attempt a quick or easy assessment of a given place. One could not, for example, determine that the photograph of Fig. 47 was taken in the fairly rural area of Pippa Passes, Kentucky and that the scene of the photograph of Fig. 46 was Shrewsbury, Massachusetts or that the photograph of Fig. 48 was taken in Niagara Falls, New York, while the photograph of Fig. 44 was shot in New York City. The photographs were taken, for the most part, on the street and at such events as weddings, festivals, regattas and parades, although they seldom focus on the apex of the event. Rather, the event serves as a framework or background for peoples' comings and goings, in the same way that the photographs taken on the street and other public places show people moving about the daily business of their lives. It is neither evident nor important that the photograph of the three women (Fig. 59) or of the man and woman (Fig. 61) were taken at a regatta, and there is no evidence that the three boys (Fig. 67) were participants in the same parade as were Ms. Hollon and the man driving her car (Fig. 68).

For the most part I think my photographs tend to invoke speculation rather than offer obvious clues to what is happening. In Fig. 69, the relationship of the man on the right to the two women on the left is unclear. Is he looking at them or beyond them? What is the point of the mask of the boy in the middle? What is the relationship of the photographer to these people? The viewer may be forced into making a decision as to whether the figure holding the mask dominates the
frame to such an extent that the scene becomes static, a discontinuous pose, or whether other elements in the photograph allow the image to be of a continuous event or relationship.

I believe that my "photographic attitude" is closely related to what A.D. Coleman sees as that mode of photography existing between what he refers to as "directorial photography," where the photographer "consciously and intentionally creates events for the express purpose of making images" and that photography he terms "informational/representational" which has traditionally required the "conviction that the image maker has not significantly intervened in the translation of event into image." That mode which reconciles the directorial and the informational/representational tends to encourage the interaction of the viewer's sensibility with that of the photographer.

I have tried to avoid the type of photography that Max Kozloff sees as exhibiting a "patness," akin to the "incriminating cast of illustration" in Andrew Wyeth's painting. Kozloff feels that a special consciousness is possible for photography—which lies between the narrative technique of fiction and the metaphoric technique of painting. The work of photographers such as Garry Winogrand he sees as stylized cliches where the "photographers may lie in wait for similar subjects, like duck shooters for their prey." For Kozloff, Winogrand's photographs are comments and "however caught by happenstance," calculated.

By not illustrating verbal themes for my exhibition I have sought to avoid this shooting of "similar subjects." I have tried to approach that style of photography which Elaine King suggests, in a review of "5 Chicago Photojournalists," goes beyond the camera's "fix." Paul Sequiera's and P. Michael O'Sullivan's photographs, King comments,
usually deal with one subject—an isolated gesture or person that compromises the entire composition of each photograph." These photographs are seen as lacking contingency, of being unable to embrace what one would like to think are the complexities of existence. But of Danny Lyon's photographs King comments:

Lyon is aware of the many aspects of a single event and how the essence of a scene is often dependent on the details and actions surrounding it. His events do not take place in an isolated world. They exist in a compounded and confused environment....

I have striven for the type of photographs which, as Dru Shipman says, "themselves, in the way they look, imply lack of intention." Such apparent randomness may be seen, I feel, in many of the photographs of Josef Koudelka, the Czech photographer. His photographs are gestures of place and time, and their universal significances, or statements, seem almost incidental to things happening within the photograph.

For Robert Frank, photography today deals with one's personal life; "it records in some way—what you see, or your environment or travels." These 35 photographs in the exhibition are a record of my environment, my travels and what I saw. There is little overt action contained in the photographs and nothing startling happens, but there is movement and direction emphasizing connections and tensions between people and objects. They don't upset the pace of experience, but unfold in much the same way in which events engage our consciousness. It would be pleasant to think they sometimes approach the quality of certain drama where the presence of people on the stage is unexplained, conversation random, nothing seems to happen, yet beneath that exterior of banality, forces, often frightening, are at
work.

I think the exhibition photographs suggest a randomness and a casualness of vision—almost peripheral vision. The scenes are commonplace, things that would normally engage our consciousness for only a brief time—if at all. But it is as if they trigger, by some sort of memory trace, an awareness of a similar situation or person, or perhaps they trigger a chain of associative relationships. One hopes the viewer comes away not with just an awareness of the particularness of the situation of the photograph, but with an awareness of its universality.
NOTES

Introduction

1 Terry Barrett, "Reading as a Method of Photographic Criticism," Exposure, 15 (December 1977), 3.


4 Thesis: Editorial policy varies according to purpose and editor.

Purpose: The purpose of this thesis is to examine different policies of editing in four different situations.

Should the advisors involved in this thesis care to edit, say, 20-30 photographs from the 60 in question, a discussion of reasons and the criteria employed for their selection might not only prove interesting, but even, one hopes, proof of the proposition that "editing procedures will differ according to the individual editor."


6 An initial interest in editing photographs developed when I first began to photograph and edit for my own thesis, and to discuss with other students at that time their concerns about both editing their work and the problems involved in reaching agreement on the editing of that work with three advisors, each bringing different values and experiences to the editing process. The role of the editor in dealing with photographs became increasingly important to me as I became involved with editing Mountain Review and Time Was and realized that the way in which different photographs were used tended to have a pronounced effect on one's interpretation of the text.

7 The Compact Edition of the Oxford English Dictionary


10 Two broad categories of photographs that might be preferable to such terms as "photojournalism" and "art" perhaps would be: photographs intended to convey information and photographs of expression.
Mountain Review


5 Conference of Humanists on Photography, Center for Photographic Studies, Louisville, Kentucky, June 1977.


7 Danziger and Conrad III, p. 67.

8 Danziger and Conrad III, p. 141.

9 Janis and MacNeil, p. 13.

10 Janis and MacNeil, p. 108.


12 Work by various photographers who are concerned with personal expression rather than illustration has been presented in the center portfolio of Mountain Review, a section of four pages. These photographs have been printed one or two to a page with no explanatory text (Figs. 5-7), unless requested and provided by the photographer.

13 Janis and MacNeil, pp. 107-108.


16 Janis and MacNeil, p. 71.

17 Janis and MacNeil, p. 64.

18 Janis and MacNeil, p. 147.
Time Was

Time Was, in many ways, is an example of the politics involved in editing. Compromises had to be made, with both the Committee and the College, that in some instances left me somewhat dissatisfied from an artistic standpoint. For example, the Committee wanted every photograph to be from Knott County and they seemed unconvinced that there were not enough interesting photographs from Knott County to warrant an entire book, while the president of the College wanted more photographs from the early days of the College. There was even discussion as to which paragraph would come first on the introductory page—the one explaining the Committee or that explaining the College (Fig. 37). I felt that the word "Bicentennial" should not be included in the title, both because there were already too many Bicentennial artifacts of questionable value around and because distribution possibilities for the book would be limited by such dating. But I was overruled.


3 Janis and MacNeil, p. 90.


III

Exhibition


2 Danziger and Conrad III, p. 28.

3 Michael Lesy's Wisconsin Death Trip provides another example of the editor who wishes to prove or illustrate a point by manipulating the choice and/or organization of a group of photographs. A.D. Coleman's "photographer as director," discussed on page 96 has a similar aim and function as the editor exemplified by Lesy or Minor. White.

4 Danziger and Conrad III, p. 126.

5 There are, in fact, several distinct ways in which a group of photographs may hang together, or may reinforce each other. For instance, photographs, whether edited by an exhibition editor or the photographer, may relate to each other thematically, may contribute to or reflect a particular theme, decided on either before or after the photographs were taken. (Winogrand's shows, for example, such as Women Are Beautiful or Public Relations, tend to offer variations upon a particular theme). Or a group of photographs may disclose a methodological, or formal, tendency (one thinks of the ways in which a group of Betty Hahn's photographs reflect her very recognizable techniques). Or, as a third example, a group of photographs may not collectively possess a common, identifiable theme, nor be wrought with a particular technique; yet they may hang together simply because they reflect how a photographer's particular sensibility confronts reality and are invested into the frame of his or her work. (I would like to think that my exhibition photographs reinforce each other in this way.)


11 Mann, p. 24.
12 Mann, p. 4.
13 Mann, p. 5.
14 Mann, p. 4.
20 Mann, p. 73.
24 Arnheim, pp. 11, 26.
25 Arnheim, p. 434.
26 Arnheim, p. 236.
27 Arnheim, p. 429.
29 Zakia, p. 15.
30 Zakia, p. 59.
32 Zakia, p. 66.
33 Danziger and Conrad III, p. 34.
While White's theories of "sequencing" and "equivalence" involve separate aspects of the photographic endeavor, they both involve a process of conversion. Sequencing, while it may enrich the possibilities of the individual photograph, tends to subsume the individual photograph to a group context, while equivalency tends to convert the photograph and/or the thing photographed into a new context.


Ellman and O'Clair, p. 1108.


Coleman, p. 56.

Kozloff, pp. 295-296.


Janis and MacNeil, p. 61.

Conventional drama and conventional audiences since the eighteenth century have demanded that all aspects of character and action must be immediately apparent--unless, as in a whodunit, the writer deliberately withholds information which will eventually tie together loose strings. But a certain line of drama, stretching from the early nineteenth century German playwright Büchner through to such contemporary writers as Pinter and Beckett, sees the audience's demand for information about where people are from, what they are doing, as counterproductive to the attempt to render the randomness, the uncertainty, with which we encounter people and events in the real world.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


